

**STATE OF CALIFORNIA
REGIONAL WATER QUALITY CONTROL BOARD
CENTRAL COAST REGION**

SUPPLEMENTAL SHEET FOR REGULAR MEETING OF JULY 11, 2008

Prepared July 9, 2008

ITEM NUMBER: 14

**SUBJECT: Comment on Proposed Individual Conditional Waiver of
Waste Discharge Requirements, Order No. R3-2008-0048
Camp Lindblad Timber Harvest, Santa Cruz County**

On July 3, 2008, Kevin Collins of Lompico Watershed Conservancy, submitted a comment letter (attached) regarding Item 14, proposed Individual Conditional Waiver of Waste Discharge Requirements (Conditional Waiver), Order No. R3-2008-0048 Camp Lindblad Timber Harvest, Santa Cruz County. The Conditional Waiver pertains to timber harvest activities proposed in Timber Harvest Plan (THP) 1-07-119 SCR Camp Lindblad. Mr. Collins requested the Central Coast Regional Water Quality Control Board (Water Board) not include the item on the consent calendar due to his concerns regarding the condition of the road network on the property. In this supplemental sheet, staff summarizes Mr. Collins' comments and then provides a response for consideration by Water Board members.

COMMENT SUMMARY

Mr. Collins' comments in the July 3, 2008 letter pertain to the condition and future management of the road network on the Camp Lindblad property. Mr. Collins is concerned that the proposed harvest activities combined with a poorly maintained road network will result in the discharge of sediment into Kings Creek. He states that although the Boy Scouts of America (Discharger) has implemented improvements to the road network as part of a harvest on the adjacent property, "this is not necessarily an indication that the [discharger] has changed their attitude about erosion control." Additionally, Mr. Collins has the following concerns:

- Dragging logs over and along steep road sections that have had structural failures in the past can increase erosion from the property.
- The practices described in the THP will add to the sediment load of Kings Creek and violate the Total Maximum Daily Load (TMDL).
- All road sections in the Watercourse and Lake Protection Zone (WLPZ) should either be rocked or abandoned.
- Since Camp Lindblad uses the road network for purposes other than timber harvest, this can result in rutting and long-term erosion damage to the road system.

- The road system should be upgraded in a more permanent way.

Finally, Mr. Collins requests Water Board staff visit the property to inspect the condition of the roads and skid trails during the first winter after the THP operations have begun and again after the completion of the logging operation.

STAFF RESPONSE

Following the first inspection of the Camp Lindblad property on April 21, 2006, Water Board staff shared the same concerns outlined in Mr. Collins July 3, 2008 letter. The road system was in poor condition. Water Board staff visited the site sixteen months later, on August 20, 2007, and found the road and associated crossings to be greatly improved. The improved condition at the site reduced potential short-term negative impacts to water quality.

However, long-term management of the Camp Lindblad property was still a problem. Therefore, Water Board staff required the Discharger to develop a Long Term Road Inventory and Corrections Program (road program) for the property. This road program is included at Attachment 5 to the staff report for agenda Item 14 and is included as item q in the proposed Conditional Waiver. The road program requires the Discharger to identify and correct erosion issues associated with the road network on the Camp Lindblad. Based on the road program, the Discharger must conduct an inspection of the road and associated infrastructure following each storm event of two-inches or greater within a twenty-four hour period, over the next fifteen years or until the next harvest, whichever comes first. Additionally, based on the road program, the Discharger may not use pickup trucks or heavy equipment on dirt roads during periods of saturated soil conditions.

According to finding 12 of the Conditional Waiver, the Discharger is required to comply with the THP, Forest Practice Rules, Board of Forestry Regulations, the conditions of Order No. R3-2008-0048, and Monitoring and Reporting Program No. R3-2008-0048. The harvest should not result in any appreciable or significant adverse changes to water quality due to erosion, sediment discharges, or turbidity and thereby should comply with TMDL requirements.

Regarding Mr. Collin's site-specific concerns regarding erosion, Water Board staff has reviewed both the THP and the site-specific field conditions and finds all proposed treatments appropriate and protective of water quality for their respective locations.

Finally, Water Board staff agrees with Mr. Collin's request that Water Board staff visit the property to inspect the condition of the roads and skid trails during the first winter after the THP operations have begun and again after the completion of the logging operation. Water Board staff will conduct such inspections.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends the Water Board approve proposed Conditional Waiver of Waste Discharge Requirements, Order No. R3-2008-0048, Camp Lindblad Timber Harvest, Santa Cruz County. Compliance with the Conditional Waiver of Waste Discharge Requirements will protect water quality and the streams associated with the timber harvest area.

ATTACHMENT

1. Lompico Watershed Conservancy letter dated July 3, 2008

S:\NPS\Timber Harvest_Case Files by Site\1-07-119 SCR Camp Lindblad\SSR3-2008-00481-07-119 SCRCampLinblad7_8_08.doc



July 3, 2003

Central Coast Regional Water Quality Control Board
Jeff Young, Chair
895 Aerovista Place, Suite 101
San Luis Obispo, CA 93401-7906

Regarding: Agenda item 14, Camp Lindblad Timber Harvest Conditional Waiver of Waste Discharge Requirements, Order No. R3-2008-0048, July 11, 2008 Watsonville CA Board Meeting

Greetings Chairperson Young,

If this item is now on the consent agenda, I request that it be moved to the regular agenda as item 14 (this is how it is shown in the on-line agenda).

This Timber Waiver is classified tier 4 meaning that it has water pollution risk factors that the Board has previously decided require individual Board consideration.

I have read the Regional Board staff report and reviewed the THP record and I would like to make the following comments.

Regional Board staff have noted the poor condition of the Camp Lindblad road system prior to use of the roads for an adjacent THP. The fact that some of these problems were corrected so that a haul road on Lindblad land could be used for the Pond THP is not necessarily an indication that the landowner, Mt. Diablo Silverado Boy Scouts of America, has changed their attitude about erosion control. On the contrary, the criteria for road use and maintenance in THP 1-07-119 indicate continued use of problem roads and crossings. CDF specified, upgrades are for temporary use and in most cases appear unlikely to result in permanent improvements.

Complex and difficult log yarding methods are proposed for this logging plan that include using the dirt haul road system for log yarding. This involves dragging logs over and along steep road sections that have had structural failures in the past. Soil disturbance and bank failures will inevitably occur. Log yarding over Class II stream crossings is also now approved by CDF. These and other actions in this THP will result in the discharge of sediment into Kings Creek, a CWA sec. 303(d) listed stream with an adopted TMDL. This THP will add to the sediment load of Kings Creek and violate the TMDL.

The CDF Pre-Harvest Inspection Report describes tractor use in the stream protections zones (WLPZ). Tractors will be used on skid trail sections crossing slopes over 65%. Tall cut banks exist on these skid trails that are essentially rough roads through highly erosive terrain. No

amount of water bars can prevent soil erosion into the streams especially in the vicinity of stream crossings.

Sections of the road at Class I WLPZ stream crossing #6 are in the Watershed Lake Protection Zone paralleling the stream on both sides and steeply ascending from the stream channel on both approaches. These and other sections of the THP are practices in lieu of the standard rule and should include rocking of the road. The THP states that WLPZ roads will be rocked *or* covered with straw and seed. The plan is entirely non-specific as to what sections of road will be rocked. All road sections in the WLPZ should be either rocked or abandoned. Camp Linblad uses this road system for general purposes not associated with this THP. Driving on straw and grass will result in rutting and long-term erosion damage to this road system. Water bars and dips will be removed or degraded over time so that water again runs down this road system carrying dirt into Kings Creek. There is photographic evidence of this type of road rutting in the CDF Pre-Harvest Inspection report.

The Board should not substitute monitoring for mitigation. Past land management is the best indication of expected future outcomes. Camp Lindblad's demonstrated lack of ongoing road maintenance in the past is an indicator for the future. Obviously the roads get improved in order to obtain the permits necessary to log this land. This road system should have been upgraded in a more permanent way. It is absurd to propose grass and straw for dirt haul roads that will be driven on for camp purposes and not abandoned after the logging plan is complete.

I request that your Board direct staff to visit this property to inspect the condition of roads and skid trails during the first winter after THP operations have begun and do so again after the completion of the logging operation. Considering the frequency of logging plans in Kings Creek this should be easy to arrange.

Regards,



Kevin Collins