CCRWQCB Meeting 3/14/2012 Comments on the Staff Report

Brad Barbeau, Ph.D.
CSU Monterey Bay School of Business

Three Cost Studies – Not Easily Comparable

- Appendix F in the Waiver document
 - Done by staff
 - Not systematic
- Barbeau & Mercer
 - Based on the March 2011 (17)
 Waiver document
 - Assessed Monitoring, Reporting, Planning and "required" management practices
 - Ag Waiver is a moving target
 - Changes made to Waiver on May 4 coincided with our interview timeframe.
- Ag Alternative
 - Also a moving target

The purpose of our cost estimates was to give growers an estimate of the costs of the proposed Ag Waiver and the Ag Alternative

Exercise caution in comparing these cost estimates – they were not designed to be comparable or competing

The Barbeau/Mercer Study

- Estimating the cost of compliance, not of management practice implementation
 - Monitoring Costs
 - Reporting Costs
 - Planning Costs
 - Costs associated with Labor and consultants
 - Practice implementation costs where mandated or where required to attain compliance

Uncertainty in Cost Estimates Due to Ambiguity in the Regulations

- Moving Target
- Tiering was in flux and difficult to interpret
- Interpretation of the requirements is challenging

This ambiguity continues to exist and can be expected to create questions as growers attempt to implement the regulations

Responsible Regulation Requires a Complete Economic Impact Report

- Costs and Losses
 - Cost to Growers
 - Planning
 - · Monitoring and Reporting
 - Implementation of Management Practices
 - · Expertise (i.e. consultants)
 - Additional Labor (for sampling, collecting data, collating data and generating reports)
 - Cost to Taxpayers
 - · Maintaining the board and staff
 - · Monitoring and Enforcement
 - Indirect and Induced Impacts
 - · Impact on related industries
 - · Secondary impact of lost buying power and tax revenue

Responsible Regulation Requires a Complete Economic Impact Report

- Gains and Benefits
 - Efficiency gains to growers
 - Reduced cost of pollution
 - Improved ecosystem services

Conclusion:

- The Barbeau/Mercer cost study is by no means a complete economic analysis, but it does contain useful information
- It should be viewed as additional information to help improve the overall results of the program
- Win/Lose approach will guarantee a suboptimal non-cooperative solution