
State Water Resources Control Board

February 11, 2014

State Water Resources Control Board
Division of Water Rights
Amanda Montgomery, Manager
Permitting and Licensing Section
P.O. Box 2000
Sacramento, CA 95812

Dear Ms. Montgomery:

EXTERNAL PEER REVIEW OF DRAFT VOLUME DEPLETION APPROACH STUDY

This letter responds to the attached October 16, 2013 request for external scientific peer review for the subject noted above. The review process is described below. All steps were conducted in confidence. Reviewers' identities were not disclosed.

To begin the process for selecting reviewers, I contacted the University of California, Berkeley (University) and requested recommendations for candidates considered qualified to perform the assignment. The University was provided with the October 16, 2013 request letter to me, and attachments, and no additional material was asked for, nor forwarded to augment the request. This service by the University includes interviews of each promising candidate and is supported through an Interagency Agreement co-signed by Cal/EPA and the University.

Each candidate who was both interested and available for the review period was asked to complete a Conflict of Interest (COI) Disclosure form and send it to me for review, with Curriculum Vitae. The cover letter for the COI form describes the context for COI concerns that must be taken into consideration when completing the form. "As noted, staff will use this information to evaluate whether a reasonable member of the public would have a serious concern about [the candidate's] ability to provide a neutral and objective review of the work product."

In subsequent letters to candidates approved as reviewers, I provided the attached January 7, 2009 Supplement to the Cal/EPA Peer Review Guidelines, which, in part serves two purposes: a) it provides guidance to ensure confidentiality through the course of the external review, and, b) it notes reviewers are under no obligation to discuss their comments with third-parties after reviews have been submitted. We recommend they do not. All outside parties are provided opportunities to address a proposed regulatory action, or potential basis for such, through a well-defined rulemaking process.

Later, I sent each reviewer the material to be reviewed and a detailed cover letter to initiate the review (examples attached).

Also attached to the cover letter was the October 16, 2013 request for reviewers to me. Its Attachment 2 was highlighted as the focus for the review. Each reviewer was asked to address each topic, as expertise allows, in the order given. Thirty days were provided for the review. I also asked reviewers to direct enquiring third-parties to me after they have submitted their reviews.

Reviewers' names, affiliations, curriculum vitae, and reviews are being sent to you now with this letter. All attachments can be electronically accessed through the bookmark icon at the left of the screen.

Approved reviewers are as follows:

- 1) Jeffrey McDonnell, Ph.D.
Professor and Director, Global Institute for Water Security
School of Environment and Sustainability
University of Saskatchewan
11 Innovation Boulevard
Saskatoon, SK S7N 3H5

Telephone: (306) 966-8529
Facsimile: (306) 966-1193
Email: jeffrey.mcdonnell@usask.ca

- 2) Julian Olden, Ph.D.
Associate Professor
School of Aquatic and Fishery Sciences
University of Washington
1122 NE Boat Street
Seattle, WA 98195

Telephone: (206) 616-3112
Facsimile: (206) 685-7471
Email: olden@u.washington.edu

- 3) Matthew Reidenbach, Ph.D.
Associate Professor
Department of Environmental Sciences
356 Clark Hall
University of Virginia
291 McCormick Road
Charlottesville, VA 22904

Telephone: (434) 243-4937
Facsimile: (434) 982-2137
Email: Reidenbach@virginia.edu

If you have questions, or require clarification from the reviewers, please contact me directly.

Regards,



Gerald W. Bowes, Ph.D.
Manager, Cal/EPA Scientific Peer Review Program
Office of Research, Planning and Performance
State Water Resources Control Board
1001 "I" Street, 16th Floor
Sacramento, California 95814

Telephone: (916) 341-5567
Fax: (916) 341-5284
Email: GBowes@waterboards.ca.gov

Attachments

- 1) October 16, 2013 Request by Amanda Montgomery for Scientific Peer Review
- 2) Example of Letter to Reviewer Initiating the Review
 - a) Jeffrey McDonnell, Ph.D., University of Saskatchewan
 - b) Julian Olden, Ph.D., University of Washington
(includes instructions for accessing FTP site)
 - c) Matthew Reidenbach, Ph.D., University of Virginia
- 3) January 7, 2009 Supplement to Cal/EPA Peer Review Guidelines
- 4) Curriculum Vitae:
 - a) Jeffrey McDonnell, Ph.D., University of Saskatchewan
 - b) Julian Olden, Ph.D., University of Washington
 - c) Matthew Reidenbach, Ph.D., University of Virginia
- 5) Reviews:
 - a) Jeffrey McDonnell, Ph.D., University of Saskatchewan
 - b) Julian Olden, Ph.D., University of Washington
 - c) Matthew Reidenbach, Ph.D., University of Virginia

ec: Barbara Evoy, Deputy Director
Division of Water Rights
Barbara.Evoy@waterboards.ca.gov

Jim Kassel, Assistant Deputy Director
Division of Water Rights
Jim.Kassel@waterboards.ca.gov