



GAVIN NEWSOM
GOVERNOR



JARED BLUMENFELD
SECRETARY FOR
ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

Colorado River Basin Regional Water Quality Control Board

CERTIFIED MAIL: 7018 0680 0002 0102 8665

February 21, 2019

Rosanna Bayon Moore, City Manager
City of Brawley
180 South Western Avenue
Brawley, CA 92227

SUBJECT: CONDITIONAL SETTLEMENT OFFER NO. R7-2019-0020: OFFER TO PARTICIPATE IN EXPEDITED PAYMENT PROGRAM RELATING TO ALLEGED VIOLATIONS OF ORDER NO. R7-2015-0004, NPDES NO. CA0104523

Dear Ms. Moore:

This letter notifies the City of Brawley, Owner/Operator, Brawley Wastewater Treatment Plant (Discharger) of alleged violation(s) of effluent limitations and provides the Discharger the opportunity to settle the violation(s) through payment of **\$21,000** in mandatory minimum penalties pursuant to California Water Code (Water Code) sections 13385 and/or 13385.1. Please reply by **March 22, 2019**.

NOTICE OF VIOLATION

The Assistant Executive Officer alleges that the Discharger has violated the above-referenced National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System (NPDES) permit as identified in Exhibit A, attached hereto and incorporated by reference. The Discharger can resolve the alleged violations as discussed below.

STATUTORY LIABILITY

Water Code section 13385, subdivisions (h) and (i), require the assessment of a \$3,000 mandatory minimum penalty for specified serious and chronic effluent limitation violations. The Discharger is also subject to discretionary administrative civil liability of up to \$10,000 per day for each violation, plus \$10 for each gallon discharged but not cleaned up in excess of 1,000 gallons. The Colorado River Basin Regional Water Quality Control Board (Regional Water Board) may assess mandatory minimum penalties and discretionary administrative civil liability beginning with the date on which the violations first occurred. The formal enforcement action that the Regional Water Board uses to assess such liability is an administrative civil liability complaint. Alternatively, the Regional Water Board may refer the matter to the Attorney General's Office for prosecution in the Superior Court. The Superior Court may assess up to \$25,000 per day for each violation, plus \$25 per gallon discharged but not cleaned up in excess of 1,000 gallons.

NANCY WRIGHT, CHAIR | PAULA RASMUSSEN, EXECUTIVE OFFICER

73-720 Fred Waring Drive, Suite 100, Palm Desert, CA 92260 | www.waterboards.ca.gov/coloradoriver

OFFER TO PARTICIPATE IN EXPEDITED PAYMENT PROGRAM

The Discharger can avoid the issuance of a formal enforcement action and settle the alleged violation(s) identified in Exhibit A by participating in the Regional Water Board's Expedited Payment Program. The Discharger may accept this Conditional Settlement Offer, waive its right to a hearing, and pay the mandatory minimum penalty of **\$21,000** for the violation(s) described in Exhibit A. If the Discharger elects to do so, the Regional Water Board will execute the settlement offer subject to the conditions below. The Regional Water Board will accept the payment in settlement of any enforcement action that would otherwise arise out of the violation(s) identified in Exhibit A. Accordingly, the Regional Water Board will not issue a formal administrative civil liability complaint, will not refer the violation(s) to the Attorney General's Office, and will waive its right to seek additional discretionary civil liability for the violation(s) identified in Exhibit A.

This Conditional Settlement Offer does not address or resolve liability for any violation that is not specifically identified in Exhibit A.

DISCHARGER'S OPTIONS FOR RESPONSE TO OFFER

To accept this Conditional Settlement Offer, the Discharger must complete, sign, and return the enclosed "Acceptance of Conditional Resolution and Waiver of Right to Hearing" (Acceptance and Waiver) on or before **March 22, 2019 (30 days)**.

If the Discharger chooses to contest any of the violations alleged in Exhibit A, please identify the specific violation(s) and the basis for the challenge (factual error, affirmative defense, etc.) on or before the due date specified above. Regional Water Board staff will evaluate the contested violation and take one of two actions:

- 1) Determine that the violation warrants dismissal, dismiss the alleged violation(s) in the California Integrated Water Quality System (CIWQS) database, notify the Discharger of the dismissal, and take no further action against the Discharger for the alleged violation(s);
or
- 2) Determine that the alleged violation(s) is/are meritorious and notify the Discharger of that determination. The Discharger will then have 30 days from the date of the notice of determination to accept settlement for the violation by submitting a complete Acceptance and Waiver. If the Discharger chooses not to accept or makes no reply to the determination within 30 days, the Discharger will be contacted by the Regional Water Board staff regarding a formal enforcement proceeding for the contested violation(s). Information received by Regional Water Board staff during any formal investigation and assessment of the violation(s), as well as staff costs associated with pursuing the enforcement, may increase the liability beyond that set forth in this Conditional Settlement Offer.

CONDITIONS FOR REGIONAL WATER BOARD ACCEPTANCE OF RESOLUTION

Federal regulations require the Regional Water Board to publish and allow the public at least 30 days to comment on any settlement of an enforcement action addressing NPDES permit violations (40 C.F.R. section 123.27(d)(2)(iii)). Upon receipt of the Discharger's Acceptance and Waiver, Regional Water Board staff will publish a notice of the proposed resolution of the violation(s).

If Regional Water Board staff do not receive comments within the 30-day comment period and no new material facts become available to the Regional Water Board, the Executive Officer will execute the Acceptance and Waiver as a stipulated order assessing the uncontested mandatory minimum penalty amount pursuant to Water Code sections 13385 and/or 13385.1.

If, however, significant comments are received in opposition to the Settlement, the Offer may be withdrawn. In that case, the Discharger's waiver pursuant to the Acceptance and Waiver will also be treated as withdrawn and the violation(s) will be addressed in a liability assessment proceeding. At the liability assessment hearing the Discharger will be free to make arguments as to any of the alleged violations, and the Discharger's agreement to accept this conditional settlement offer will not in any way be binding or used as evidence against the Discharger. The Discharger will be provided with further information on the liability assessment proceeding.

In the event the Executive Officer executes the Acceptance and Waiver, full payment of the assessed amount shall be due within 30 calendar days from the date of the Executive Officer's signature. Funds collected for violations under Water Code sections 13385 and 13385.1 shall be deposited in the State Water Pollution Cleanup and Abatement Account. Accordingly, the **\$21,000** liability shall be paid by cashiers or certified check made out to the "State Water Pollution Cleanup and Abatement Account". Failure to pay the full penalty within the required time may subject the Discharger to further liability.

Please send your reply to the attention of Kai Dunn, either by email or U.S. mail. If you want to discuss or have questions regarding this Conditional Settlement Offer, please contact Kai Dunn at (760) 776-8986 or Kai.Dunn@waterboards.ca.gov.

Sincerely,



Frank Gonzalez, P.E.
Assistant Executive Officer
Colorado River Basin
Regional Water Quality Control Board

MJ/tab

Enclosure: Exhibit A – Notice of Violation
Exhibit B - Acceptance of Conditional Resolution and Waiver of Right to Hearing

File: WDID No. 7A 13 0100 011, City of Brawley WWTP
ECM: CW-210272

MANDATORY PENALTY ADMINISTRATIVE CIVIL LIABILITY

Brawley City

Brawley City WWTP

WDID No. 7A130100011 NPDES No. CA0104523

EXHIBIT "A"

Effluent Limitation Violations Requiring Mandatory Minimum Penalties

#	Violation Number	Violation Date	Constituent	Pollutant Group	Limitation Period	Limit	Result/Average	Units	% Over Limit	Date 180 Days Prior	Serious or Chronic Violation?	Penalty
1	1012459	07/13/2016	Bis (2-Ethylhexyl)	Group 2	Daily Maximum	12	53	ug/L	342%	01/15/2016	S	\$ 3,000
2	1029136	07/13/2016	Bis (2-Ethylhexyl)	Group 2	Daily Maximum	0.59	0.91	lb/day	54%	01/15/2016	S	\$ 3,000
3	1029138	07/31/2016	Bis (2-Ethylhexyl)	Group 2	Monthly Average	5.9	53	ug/L	798%	02/02/2016	S	\$ 3,000
4	1029137	07/31/2016	Bis (2-Ethylhexyl)	Group 2	Monthly Average	0.29	0.91	lb/day	214%	02/02/2016	S	\$ 3,000
5	1029135	01/04/2017	Copper, Total	Group 2	Maximum Daily	38	41.5	ug/L	9%	07/08/2016	S	\$ 3,000
6	1020979	01/31/2017	Copper, Total	Group 2	30-Day Average	19	41.3	ug/L	117%	08/04/2016	N/A	\$ 0
7	1023104	02/28/2017	Copper, Total	Group 2	Monthly Average	19	27	ug/L	42%	09/01/2016	N/A	\$ 0
8	1027558	05/31/2017	Copper, Total	Group 2	Monthly Average	19	35.04	ug/L	84%	12/02/2016	C	\$ 3,000
9	1043796	04/30/2018	Copper, Total	Group 2	Monthly Average	19	23.13	ug/L	22%	11/01/2017	N/A	\$ 0
10	1048532	08/01/2018	Copper, Total	Group 2	Daily Maximum	38	41.2	ug/L	8%	02/02/2018	N/A	\$ 0
11	1051236	09/19/2018	Copper, Total	Group 2	Daily Discharge	38	44.2	ug/L	16%	03/23/2018	N/A	\$ 0
12	1053067	10/05/2018	Copper, Total	Group 2	Monthly Average	19	25.4	ug/L	34%	04/08/2018	C	\$ 3,000

\$ 21,000

1 - Violation occurs on sample date or last date of averaging period.

2 - For Group I pollutants, a violation is serious when the limit is exceeded by 40% or more

- For Group II pollutants, a violation is serious when the limit is exceeded by 20% or more

3 - When a serious violation occurs on the same day as a chronic, the serious violation is only assessed an MMP once and is counted last for the day when determining the number of chronic violations to be assessed a

Violation period ending the last day of October 2018

Group I Violations Assessed MMP: 0

Group II Violations Assessed MMP: 7

Other Effluent Violations Assessed MMP: 0

Violations Exempt from MMP: 0

Total Violations Assessed MMP: 7

Mandatory Minimum Penalty = (5 Serious Violations + 2 Non-Serious Violations) x \$3,000 = \$21,000

Exhibit B
ACCEPTANCE OF CONDITIONAL RESOLUTION
AND WAIVER OF RIGHT TO HEARING

City of Brawley, Owner/Operator
Brawley Wastewater Treatment Plant
WDR Order No. R7-2015-0004 (NPDES No. CA0104523)

By signing below and returning this Acceptance of Conditional Resolution and Waiver of Right to Hearing (Acceptance and Waiver) to the California Regional Water Quality Control Board, Colorado River Basin Region (Regional Water Board), the City of Brawley, Owner/Operator, Brawley Wastewater Treatment Plant (Discharger) hereby accepts the conditional settlement offer to settle the alleged violation(s) through payment of mandatory minimum penalties and waives the right to a hearing before the Regional Water Board to dispute the alleged violation(s). The alleged violation(s) are attached to this Acceptance and Waiver as 'Exhibit A' and incorporated by reference.

The Discharger agrees that 'Exhibit A' shall serve as a Complaint pursuant to Article 2.5 of the California Water Code and that no separate Complaint is required for the Regional Water Board to assert jurisdiction over the alleged violation(s) through its Assistant Executive Officer. The Discharger agrees to pay the penalties required by California Water Code sections 13385 and/or 13385.1, in the sum of **\$21,000** (Expedited Payment Amount), which shall be deemed payment in full of any civil liability pursuant to Water Code section 13385 that otherwise might be assessed for the violation(s) described in 'Exhibit A'. The Discharger understands that this Acceptance and Waiver waives its right to contest the allegations in 'Exhibit A' and the amount of civil liability assessed for the violation(s).

The Discharger understands that this Acceptance and Waiver does not address or resolve liability for any violation that is not specifically identified in 'Exhibit A'.

Upon execution by the Discharger, the completed Acceptance and Waiver shall be returned to:

California Regional Water Quality Control Board, Colorado River Basin
Attention: Kai Dunn
73720 Fred Waring Drive, Suite 100
Palm Desert, CA 92260

The Discharger understands that federal regulations set forth at Code of Federal Regulations, title 40, section 123.27(d)(2)(iii) require the Regional Water Board to publish notice of and provide at least thirty (30) days for public comment on any proposed resolution of an enforcement action addressing NPDES permit violations. Accordingly, this Acceptance and Waiver will be published as required by law for public comment prior to the Executive Officer's execution.

The Discharger understands that if no comments are received within the public notice period that causes the Executive Officer to question the conditional settlement offer, the Executive Officer will execute this Acceptance and Waiver.

The Discharger understands that if significant comments are received in opposition to the conditional settlement offer, the offer may be withdrawn. In that circumstance, the Discharger will be advised of the withdrawal and an administrative civil liability complaint may be issued and the matter may be set for a hearing before the Regional Water Board. For such a liability hearing, the Discharger understands that its executed Acceptance and Waiver will be treated as a settlement communication and will not be used as evidence in that hearing.

The Discharger understands that once the Executive Officer executes this Acceptance and Waiver, the full payment required by the deadline set forth below is a condition of this Acceptance and Waiver.

The Discharger understands that funds collected for violations under Water Code sections 13385 and 13385.1 shall be deposited in the State Water Pollution Cleanup and Abatement Account. Accordingly, the liability shall be paid by a cashier's or certified check for **\$21,000** made out to the "State Water Pollution Cleanup and Abatement Account."

The Discharger understands that payment must be submitted to the State Water Resources Control Board no later than thirty (30) calendar days after the date on which the Executive Officer executes this Acceptance and Waiver.

The Discharger shall mail the check to:

State Water Resources Control Board
Division of Administrative Services, Accounting Branch
Attn: ACL Payment
PO Box 1888
Sacramento, CA 95812-1888

I hereby affirm that I am duly authorized to act on behalf of and to bind the Discharger in the making and giving of this Acceptance and Waiver.

City of Brawley WWTP

By: _____
Signed Name Date

Printed or Typed Name Title

Note: Please return the signed Acceptance and Waiver with Exhibit A, together.

IT IS SO ORDERED PURSUANT TO WATER CODE SECTION 13385.

By: _____
PAULA RASMUSSEN Date
Executive Officer

Conditional Settlement Offer No. R7-2019-0020

**Exhibit B
ACCEPTANCE OF CONDITIONAL RESOLUTION
AND WAIVER OF RIGHT TO HEARING**

City of Brawley, Owner/Operator
Brawley Wastewater Treatment Plant
WDR Order No. R7-2015-0004 (NPDES No. CA0104523)

By signing below and returning this Acceptance of Conditional Resolution and Waiver of Right to Hearing (Acceptance and Waiver) to the California Regional Water Quality Control Board, Colorado River Basin Region (Regional Water Board), the City of Brawley, Owner/Operator, Brawley Wastewater Treatment Plant (Discharger) hereby accepts the conditional settlement offer to settle the alleged violation(s) through payment of mandatory minimum penalties and waives the right to a hearing before the Regional Water Board to dispute the alleged violation(s). The alleged violation(s) are attached to this Acceptance and Waiver as 'Exhibit A' and incorporated by reference.

The Discharger agrees that 'Exhibit A' shall serve as a Complaint pursuant to Article 2.5 of the California Water Code and that no separate Complaint is required for the Regional Water Board to assert jurisdiction over the alleged violation(s) through its Assistant Executive Officer. The Discharger agrees to pay the penalties required by California Water Code sections 13385 and/or 13385.1, in the sum of **\$21,000** (Expedited Payment Amount), which shall be deemed payment in full of any civil liability pursuant to Water Code section 13385 that otherwise might be assessed for the violation(s) described in 'Exhibit A'. The Discharger understands that this Acceptance and Waiver waives its right to contest the allegations in 'Exhibit A' and the amount of civil liability assessed for the violation(s).

The Discharger understands that this Acceptance and Waiver does not address or resolve liability for any violation that is not specifically identified in 'Exhibit A'.

Upon execution by the Discharger, the completed Acceptance and Waiver shall be returned to:

California Regional Water Quality Control Board, Colorado River Basin
Attention: Kai Dunn
73720 Fred Waring Drive, Suite 100
Palm Desert, CA 92260

The Discharger understands that federal regulations set forth at Code of Federal Regulations, title 40, section 123.27(d)(2)(iii) require the Regional Water Board to publish notice of and provide at least thirty (30) days for public comment on any proposed resolution of an enforcement action addressing NPDES permit violations. Accordingly, this Acceptance and Waiver will be published as required by law for public comment prior to the Executive Officer's execution.

The Discharger understands that if no comments are received within the public notice period that causes the Executive Officer to question the conditional settlement offer, the Executive Officer will execute this Acceptance and Waiver.

The Discharger understands that if significant comments are received in opposition to the conditional settlement offer, the offer may be withdrawn. In that circumstance, the Discharger will be advised of the withdrawal and an administrative civil liability complaint may be issued and the matter may be set for a hearing before the Regional Water Board. For such a liability hearing, the Discharger understands that its executed Acceptance and Waiver will be treated as a settlement communication and will not be used as evidence in that hearing.

RECEIVED
MAR 18 2019
REGION 7

The Discharger understands that once the Executive Officer executes this Acceptance and Waiver, the full payment required by the deadline set forth below is a condition of this Acceptance and Waiver.

The Discharger understands that funds collected for violations under Water Code sections 13385 and 13385.1 shall be deposited in the State Water Pollution Cleanup and Abatement Account. Accordingly, the liability shall be paid by a cashier's or certified check for \$21,000 made out to the "State Water Pollution Cleanup and Abatement Account."

The Discharger understands that payment must be submitted to the State Water Resources Control Board no later than thirty (30) calendar days after the date on which the Executive Officer executes this Acceptance and Waiver.

The Discharger shall mail the check to:

State Water Resources Control Board
Division of Administrative Services, Accounting Branch
Attn: ACL Payment
PO Box 1888
Sacramento, CA 95812-1888

I hereby affirm that I am duly authorized to act on behalf of and to bind the Discharger in the making and giving of this Acceptance and Waiver.

City of Brawley WWTP

By: Paula Rasmusen 3.14.2019
Signed Name Date

Paula Rasmusen City Manager
Printed or Typed Name Title

Note: Please return the signed Acceptance and Waiver with Exhibit A, together.

IT IS SO ORDERED PURSUANT TO WATER CODE SECTION 13385.

By: PAULA RASMUSSEN _____
Executive Officer Date

RECEIVED
MAR 18 2019
REGION 7

MANDATORY PENALTY ADMINISTRATIVE CIVIL LIABILITY

Brawley City

Brawley City WWTP

WDID No. 7A130100011 NPDES No. CA0104523

EXHIBIT "A"

Effluent Limitation Violations Requiring Mandatory Minimum Penalties

#	Violation Number	Violation Date	Constituent	Pollutant Group	Limitation Period	Limit	Result/Average	Units	% Over Limit	Date 180 Days Prior	Serious or Chronic Violation?	Penalty
1	1012459	07/13/2016	Bis (2-Ethylhexyl)	Group 2	Daily Maximum	12	53	ug/L	342%	01/15/2016	S	\$ 3,000
2	1029136	07/13/2016	Bis (2-Ethylhexyl)	Group 2	Daily Maximum	0.59	0.91	lb/day	54%	01/15/2016	S	\$ 3,000
3	1029138	07/31/2016	Bis (2-Ethylhexyl)	Group 2	Monthly Average	5.9	53	ug/L	798%	02/02/2016	S	\$ 3,000
4	1029137	07/31/2016	Bis (2-Ethylhexyl)	Group 2	Monthly Average	0.29	0.91	lb/day	214%	02/02/2016	S	\$ 3,000
5	1029135	01/04/2017	Copper, Total	Group 2	Maximum Daily	38	41.5	ug/L	9%	07/08/2016	S	\$ 3,000
6	1020979	01/31/2017	Copper, Total	Group 2	30-Day Average	19	41.3	ug/L	117%	08/04/2016	N/A	\$ 0
7	1023104	02/28/2017	Copper, Total	Group 2	Monthly Average	19	27	ug/L	42%	09/01/2016	N/A	\$ 0
8	1027558	05/31/2017	Copper, Total	Group 2	Monthly Average	19	35.04	ug/L	84%	12/02/2016	C	\$ 3,000
9	1043798	04/30/2018	Copper, Total	Group 2	Monthly Average	19	23.13	ug/L	22%	11/01/2017	N/A	\$ 0
10	1048532	08/01/2018	Copper, Total	Group 2	Daily Maximum	38	41.2	ug/L	8%	02/02/2018	N/A	\$ 0
11	1051236	09/19/2018	Copper, Total	Group 2	Daily Discharge	38	44.2	ug/L	16%	03/23/2018	N/A	\$ 0
12	1053067	10/05/2018	Copper, Total	Group 2	Monthly Average	19	25.4	ug/L	34%	04/08/2018	C	\$ 3,000

\$ 21,000

1 - Violation occurs on sample date or last date of averaging period.

2 - For Group I pollutants, a violation is serious when the limit is exceeded by 40% or more

- For Group II pollutants, a violation is serious when the limit is exceeded by 20% or more

3 - When a serious violation occurs on the same day as a chronic, the serious violation is only assessed an MMP once and is counted last for the day when determining the number of chronic violations to be assessed a

Violation period ending the last day of October 2018

Group I Violations Assessed MMP: 0

Group II Violations Assessed MMP: 7

Other Effluent Violations Assessed MMP: 0

Violations Exempt from MMP: 0

Total Violations Assessed MMP: 7

Mandatory Minimum Penalty = (5 Serious Violations + 2 Non-Serious Violations) x \$3,000 = \$21,000

RECEIVED

MAR 18 2019

REGION 7