CALIFORNIA REGIONAL WATER QUALITY CONTROL BOARD

NORTH COAST REGION

Cleanup and Abatement and Investigative Order No. R1-2026-0060

Amending Cleanup and Abatement and Investigative Order No. R1-2024-0047

for

Aaron Lieberman, Paradise Valley, LLC, Northland Management Group LLC and Northcoast Investment Group LLC

Assessor's Parcel Numbers 220-292-015, 220-292-017 and 220-292-018

Humboldt County

This Order is issued to Aaron Lieberman, Paradise Valley LLC, Northland Management Group LLC and Northcoast Investment Group LLC (hereafter collectively referred to as the Dischargers) based on provisions of Water Code section 13304, which authorizes the North Coast Regional Water Quality Control Board (North Coast Water Board) to issue a cleanup and abatement order, and Water Code section 13267, which authorizes the North Coast Water Board to issue investigative orders requiring the preparation and submittal of technical and monitoring reports (collectively, the Order). This Order amends the requirements set forth in Cleanup and Abatement and Investigative Order No. R1-2024-0047, previously issued to the Dischargers, and establishes revised deadlines for the required actions pursuant to the settlement of Administrative Civil Liability Complaint No. R1-2025-0033.

The Executive Officer finds, with respect to the Dischargers' acts, or failure to act, the following:

Purpose of the Order

1. This Order requires the Dischargers to clean up and abate the effects of construction and inadequate maintenance of developed features including graded cultivation flats, roads, stream crossings and a reservoir on Humboldt County Assessor Parcel Numbers (APNs) 220-292-015, 220-292-017 and 220-292-018 (hereafter the Property) and to eliminate the threat of future discharges to unnamed tributaries of Blue Slide Creek and Miller Creek. Investigation and cleanup actions required under this Order shall be conducted to comply with Porter-Cologne Water Quality Control Act (Wat. Code § 13000 *et seq.)*, the *Water Quality Control Plan for the North Coast Region* (Basin Plan), State Water Resources Control Board (State Water Board) *Policies and Procedures for Investigation and Cleanup and Abatement of Discharges under Water Code Section 13304* (Resolution 92-49); and other applicable State and Regional Water Board plans, policies, and regulations.
2. This Order amends Cleanup and Abatement and Investigative Order No. R1-2024-0047, issued by the Executive Officer for the North Coast Water Board on

September 17, 2024, to Aaron Lieberman, Paradise Valley LLC, Northland Management Group LLC and Northcoast Investment Group LLC. Order No. R1-2024-0047 is included herein as Enclosure 3 of this Order.

Property Location and Description

3. The Property consists of three parcels totaling approximately 146 acres and is located at 3939 Blue Slide Creek Road, Redway, in southwestern Humboldt County (Latitude 40.137989, Longitude -123.931044). The Property straddles a ridge, with numerous unnamed ephemeral Class III and intermittent Class II watercourses tributary to Blue Slide Creek and Miller Creek. Blue Slide Creek is tributary to the Mattole River and Miller Creek is tributary to Redwood Creek, which is tributary to the South Fork Eel River. The Mattole River and the South Fork Eel River are both Clean Water Act section 303(d)-listed as impaired due to elevated water temperature and excess sedimentation. The U.S. Environmental Protection Agency established Total Maximum Daily Loads (TMDL) for temperature and sediment for the South Fork Eel River in 1999 and in 2002 for the Mattole River. Blue Slide Creek and Miller Creek, and their unnamed tributaries, are waters of the state.

Property Ownership History

4. Humboldt County APNs 220-292-015, 220-292-017 and 220-292-018 (collectively the Property) are the subject of Order No. R1-2024-0047. Parcel information available from the Humboldt County Assessor's Office, as accessed via Digital Map Products' Lightbox Vision online service, indicates that Northcoast Investment Group LLC purchased APNs 220-292-017 and 220-292-018 on June 7, 2012, and Northland Management Group LLC purchased APN 220-292-015 on December 6, 2013.

    a. APN 220-292-015: On November 6, 2024, APN 220-292-015 was transferred to Reprop Investments Inc. via foreclosure. On May 27, 2025, John Pegram purchased APN 220-292-015 from Reprop Investments Inc.

    b. APNs 220-292-017 and 220-292-018: These APNs are conjoined parcels with a single property title. On February 2, 2026, John Pegram purchased APNs 220-292-017 and 220-292-018 from Northcoast Investment Group LLC.

Responsible Parties

5. This Order finds that the Dischargers are responsible parties based on the following:

    a. For the purpose of this Order, the North Coast Water Board finds the Dischargers are responsible parties under this Order as the prior Property

owners and cannabis cultivation operators at all times the North Coast Water Board staff (Staff) documented the activities that resulted in discharges and threatened discharges necessitating this Order:

i. Northcoast Management Group and Northland Investment Group owned the Property at the time Staff documented the site conditions and are responsible parties due to their ownership of the Property during the period the conditions creating pollution occurred and had the ability and legal authority prevent the unauthorized site development. These entities were named as responsible parties in Order No. R1-2024-0047.

ii. Aaron Lieberman is named as a responsible party as the individual identified as the cannabis cultivation operator and enrollee under Order No. R1-2015-0023 Waiver of Waste Discharge Requirements and *General Water Quality Certification for Discharges of Waste Resulting from Cannabis Cultivation and Associated Activities or Operation with Similar Environmental Effects in the North Coast Region* (Regional Cannabis Order), effective March 3, 2016, and subsequently the State Water Board Order WQ 2019-0000-DWQ *General Waste Discharge Requirements for Discharges of Waste Associated with Cannabis Cultivation Activities* (Cannabis General Order) effective November 30, 2018. Aaron Lieberman, as an individual, was named as a responsible party in Order No. R1-2024-0047.

iii. Paradise Valley, LLC, is named as a responsible party as the cannabis cultivation operator at the time of the site development. The entity is identified as a discharger in the Cannabis General Order, as well as, the Department of Cannabis Control issued Paradise Valley, LLC, provisional outdoor cultivation license for the Property, No. CCL18-0003423 effective July 25, 2019. Paradise Valley, LLC, was named as a responsible party in Order No. R1-2024-0047.

b. The North Coast Water Board reserves the right to amend this Order, or issue a subsequent Order, to add additional responsible parties when/if those parties are identified.

Factual Basis of Order

6. Effective March 3, 2016, Aaron Lieberman enrolled APN 220-292-015 under Order No. R1-2015-0023 *Waiver of Waste Discharge Requirements and General Water Quality Certification for Discharges of Waste Resulting from Cannabis Cultivation and Associated Activities or Operation with Similar Environmental Effects in the North Coast Region* (Regional Cannabis Order).

7. On November 30, 2018, Aaron Lieberman submitted information through the State Water Resources Control Board's (State Water Board) online portal for discharges of waste associated with cannabis cultivation related activities on the Property. The information submitted constituted an application to transition coverage from the Regional Cannabis Order to the State Water Board Order WQ 2019-0000-DWQ *General Waste Discharge Requirements for Discharges of Waste Associated with Cannabis Cultivation Activities* (Cannabis General Order). The enrollment in the Cannabis General Order became effective on July 1, 2019, with WDID 1_12CC40717.

8. Staff conducted compliance inspections of the Property on August 31, 2017, May 24, 2018, July 24, 2018, March 7, 2019, October 17, 2019, and most recently on May 19, 2022, and found impacts and threatened impacts to the quality and beneficial uses of waters of the state from the Property. Staff found that the Dischargers failed to comply with the conditions of their enrollment under the Regional Cannabis Order and subsequently the Cannabis General Order by failing to develop adequate technical reports and implement required remediation actions. In efforts to bring the Dischargers in compliance with their regulatory requirements, Staff provided the Dischargers and their consultants with extensive compliance assistance.

9. On June 22, 2022, the North Coast Water Board issued a Notice of Violation to the Dischargers, accompanied by a compilation of Staff's previous inspection reports (provided as Enclosure 5 to this Order). The Notice of Violation documented that the Dischargers caused or permitted, cause or permit, or threaten to cause or permit waste to be discharged or deposited where it is, or probably will be, discharged into the waters of the state and create or threaten to create a condition of pollution, associated with the developed features, including: Seven legacy earthworks located within riparian setbacks and associated cultivation activities pose threats of sediment discharge to watercourses;

    a. Ten legacy stream crossings pose threats of sediment discharge to watercourses;

    b. Unstable areas associated with fill failures at three of the flats constructed for cultivation activities in 2016/2017 pose threats of sediment discharge to watercourses;

    c. Unauthorized discharge of earthen fill during the 2017 construction of two stream crossings; and

    d. Unauthorized discharge and threatened discharge of waste from inadequately designed and maintained roads, with hydrologic connectivity to streams, and general lack of maintenance of erosion and sediment control measures.

10. On June 20, 2022, the North Coast Water Board received an application for Discharges of Dredged or Fill Material to waters of the state for Paradise Valley, LLC, prepared by Green Roads Consulting. On December 31, 2023, Green Roads Consulting went out of business. Timberland Resource Consultants took over the application process and submitted final application documents to the North Coast Water Board on May 31, 2023. On June 7, 2023, the North Coast Water Board issued Paradise Valley, LLC and Aaron Lieberman a Notice of Applicability for coverage under the Cannabis General Water Quality Certification, and Order No. WQ 2019-0001-DWQ General Waste Discharge Requirements (Water Quality Certification), certifying conditional coverage for the instream work, including replacement of eight stream crossings, decommissioning three stream crossings, upgrading two stream crossings, and restoring two watercourses.
11. On December 15, 2023, the State Water Board terminated Aaron Lieberman's Tier 2 High Risk enrollment under the Cannabis General Order due to multiple unpaid annual invoices.
12. On September 17, 2024, the Executive Officer for the North Coast Water Board issued Order No. R1-2024-0047 to Aaron Lieberman, Paradise Valley LLC, Northland Management Group LLC and Northcoast Investment Group LLC. Order No. R1-2024-0047 required the preparation and submittal of technical and monitoring reports by specific deadlines, including submittal of a proposed CRMP by November 8, 2024 (Required Action 1). On September 19, 2024, Mr. Lieberman responded to the electronic transmission of Order No. R1-2024-0047.
13. The Dischargers failed to comply with Required Action 1 of Order No. R1-2024-0047 by the November 8, 2024 deadline. On November 13, 2024, Staff transmitted a Notice of Violation to the Dischargers. The Notice of Violation explained that the Dischargers risked the North Coast Water Board imposing administrative civil liability if they did not comply with the required actions of Order No. R1-2024-0047. The Dischargers did not act to correct the failure to comply with Required Action 1.
14. On September 8, 2025, the Assistance Executive Officer of the North Coast Water Board issued the Dischargers Administrative Civil Liability Complaint. No. R1-2025-0033 (Complaint). The Complaint alleged that the Dischargers failed to comply with Required Action 1 of Order No. R1-2024-0047 by failing to submit a Cleanup Restoration and Monitoring Plan subject to review and concurrence by the North Coast Water Board or its delegated officer by November 8, 2024. The Complaint proposed an administrative civil liability amount of $55,176 for the alleged violation, pursuant to Water Code section 13268.
15. On September 23, 2025, in response to the Complaint, the Dischargers submitted a request to delay the hearing and enter into confidential settlement discussions to resolve the Complaint. As part of the actions necessary to resolve

the Complaint, the Dischargers agreed to issuance of this amended Cleanup Order and proposed dates by which they could take the actions necessary to remediate the Property. In conjunction with Staff, the Dischargers proposed dates by which cleanup of the Property could be achieved. The Required Action deadlines in this Order reflect the dates the Dischargers and Staff negotiated and agreed were reasonable based on the circumstances.

On April 29, 2026, the North Coast Water Board posted a conditional settlement offer to the Dischargers for the failure to submit the CRMP under Order No. R1-2024-0047, as signed by the Dischargers and the Assistant Executive Officer. The thirty day comment period on the conditional settlement offer opened on April 29, 2026, and ended on May 29, 2026; no comments were received.

On September 4, 2026, consistent with the settlement agreement, the Dischargers submitted a CRMP (the 2026 CRMP), stamped by Kim Preston, a licensed civil engineer with consulting company Omsberg and Preston, developed in coordination with ETA Humboldt (Enclosure 2). Staff reviewed and concurred with the 2026 CRMP on September 25, 2026. (Enclosure 1)

16. This Order amends the requirements set forth in Cleanup and Investigative Order No. R1-2024-0047, containing the revised deadlines for the required actions as part of the settlement of Administrative Civil Liability Complaint No. R1-2025-0033.

Beneficial Uses, Basin Plan Prohibitions, and Water Quality Objectives

17. The Basin Plan[1] designates beneficial uses of water within Hydrologic Subareas, establishes water quality objectives, contains implementation programs for achieving objectives, and incorporates by reference the plans and policies adopted by the State and Regional Water Boards.

    a. Existing and potential beneficial uses for the Mattole Hydrologic Area and the Benbow Hydrologic Subarea of the South Fork Eel River include the following: Municipal and Domestic Supply (MUN); Agricultural Supply (AGR): Industrial Service Supply (IND); Industrial Process Supply (PRO); Groundwater Recharge (GWR); Freshwater Replenishment (FRSH); Navigation (NAV); Hydropower Generation (POW); Water Contact Recreation (REC-1); Non-Contact Water Recreation (REC-2); Commercial Sport Fishing (COMM); Cold Freshwater Habitat (COLD); Wildlife Habitat (WILD); Rare, Threatened, or Endangered Species (RARE); Migration of Aquatic Organisms (MIGR); Spawning, Reproduction, and/or Early Development (SPWN); and Aquaculture (AQUA). The Mattole Hydrologic Area beneficial uses also include Warm Freshwater Habitat (WARM).

[1] (https://www.waterboards.ca.gov/northcoast/water_issues/programs/basin_plan/)

Beneficial uses of any specifically identified water body generally apply to all its tributaries.

b. The Basin Plan contains specific standards and provisions for maintaining high-quality waters of the state that provide protection to the beneficial uses identified. The Basin Plan's *Action Plan for Logging, Construction, and Associated Activities* includes the following waste discharge prohibitions:

   i. Prohibition 1 – "The discharge of soil, silt, bark, slash, sawdust, or other organic and earthen material from any logging, construction, or associated activity of whatever nature into any stream or watercourse[2] in the basin in quantities deleterious to fish, wildlife, or other beneficial uses is prohibited."

   ii. Prohibition 2 – "The placing or disposal of soil, silt, bark, slash, sawdust, or other organic and earthen material from any logging, construction, or associated activity of whatever nature at locations where such material could pass into any stream or watercourse in the basin in quantities deleterious to fish, wildlife, or other beneficial uses is prohibited."

c. The *Water Quality Objectives* chapter of the Basin Plan provides water quality objectives that are not to be exceeded as a result of waste discharges. The water quality objectives considered of particular importance in protecting the beneficial uses from unreasonable effects due to waste discharges from land development activities include the following:

   i. Sediment: "The suspended sediment load and suspended sediment discharge rate of surface waters shall not be altered in such a manner as to cause nuisance or adversely affect beneficial uses."

   ii. Settleable Material: "Waters shall not contain substances in concentrations that result in deposition of material that causes nuisance or adversely affect beneficial uses."

[2] As provided in the *Action Plan for Logging, Construction, and Associated Activities* of the Basin Plan, "[t]he definition for 'stream or watercourse' as those terms are used in the waste discharge prohibitions relative to logging and construction activities shall be interpreted by the North Coast Water Board to mean the following: Natural watercourse as designated by a solid line or dash and three dots symbol shown in blue on the largest scale United State Geological Survey Topographic Map most recently published."

iii. Suspended Material: "Waters shall not contain suspended material in concentrations that cause nuisance or adversely affect beneficial uses."

iv. Turbidity: "Turbidity shall not be increased more than 20 percent above naturally occurring background levels. Allowable zones of dilution within which higher percentages can be tolerated may be defined for specific discharges upon the issuance of discharge permits or waiver thereof."

North Coast Water Board and State Water Board Resolutions

18. As part of North Coast Water Board's efforts to control sediment discharges and restore sediment-impaired water bodies, the North Coast Water Board adopted the *Total Maximum Daily Load Implementation Policy Statement for Sediment Impaired Receiving Waters in the North Coast Region* (also known as the Sediment TMDL Implementation Policy), on November 29, 2004. This Policy was adopted through Resolution R1- 2004-0087. The Sediment TMDL Implementation Policy directs the Executive Officer to use "all available authorities, including existing regulatory standards and permitting and enforcement tools, to more effectively and efficaciously pursue compliance with sediment-related standards by all dischargers of sediment waste." The goals of the policy are to control sediment discharges to impaired water bodies so that the TMDLs are met, sediment water quality objectives are attained, and beneficial uses are no longer adversely affected by sediment.

    The Mattole River and South Fork Eel River temperature TMDLs assigned temperature load allocations corresponding to solar radiation loads that occur when riparian vegetation is at full potential growth conditions. To address sources of elevated water temperature to reduce impairments, the North Coast Water Board included in the Basin Plan, the *Action Plan to Address Elevated Water Temperatures in the Mattole River Watershed* and *Action Plan to Address Elevated Water Temperatures in the Eel River Watershed*. On nonfederal lands, parties conducting activities associated with agriculture that discharge waste or have the potential to discharge waste shall implement riparian management measures that meet the riparian shade load allocations (shade consistent with full potential vegetation conditions) and water quality standards.

19. State Water Board Resolution 92-49 sets forth the policies and procedures to be used during an investigation and cleanup of a polluted site and requires that cleanup levels be consistent with State Water Board Resolution 68-16, *Statement of Policy with Respect to Maintaining High Quality Waters in California* ("Resolution 68-16"). Resolution 92-49 requires waste to be cleaned up in a manner that promotes attainment of either background water quality, or the best water quality that is reasonable if background levels of water quality cannot be

restored. Any alternative cleanup level to background must: (1) be consistent with the maximum benefit to the people of the state; (2) not unreasonably affect present and anticipated beneficial use of such water; and (3) not result in water quality less than that prescribed in the Basin Plan and applicable Water Quality Control Plans and Policies of the State Water Board. Resolution 92-49 directs that investigations and cleanup and abatement proceed in a progressive sequence. To the extent practical, it directs the North Coast Water Board to require and review for adequacy written work plans for each element and phase, and the written reports that describe the results of each phase of the investigation and cleanup. Additionally, Executive Order W59-93, also referred to as the "No Net Loss Policy," which has been incorporated into the Basin Plan, acknowledges the environmental and economic benefits of wetlands to the people of this state and identifies three primary objectives, including protection against net loss and an aim for long-term net gain in the quantity, quality, and permanence of wetlands acreage and values in California.

Legal Basis of the Order

20. Water Code section 13304, subdivision (a) states, in relevant part: "A person who has discharged or discharges waste into waters of this state in violation of any waste discharge requirements or other order or prohibition issued by a regional board or the state board, or who has caused or permitted, causes or permits, or threatens to cause or permit any waste to be discharged or deposited where it is, or probably will be, discharged into the waters of the state and causes, or threatens to create, a condition of pollution or nuisance, shall upon order of the regional board clean up the waste or abate the effects of the waste, or, in the case of threatened pollution or nuisance, take other necessary remedial action, including, but not limited to, overseeing cleanup and abatement efforts. Upon failure of any person to comply with the cleanup or abatement order, the Attorney General, at the request of the board, shall petition the superior court for that county for the issuance of an injunction requiring the person to comply with the order. In the suit, the court shall have jurisdiction to grant a prohibitory or mandatory injunction, either preliminary or permanent, as the facts may warrant."

21. "Waste" is defined by Water Code section 13050, subdivision (d) to include, sewage and any and all other waste substances, liquid, solid, gaseous, or radioactive, associated with human habitation, or of human or animal origin, or from any producing, manufacturing, or processing operation, including waste placed within containers of whatever nature, prior to, and for purposes of, disposal. Earthen material, including sediment when discharged to waters of the state, is a "waste" as defined in Water Code section 13050, subdivision (d). The Dischargers have caused or permitted waste to be discharged or deposited where it will be, or has the potential to be, discharged to tributaries of Blue Slide Creek and Miller Creek.

22. "Pollution" is defined by Water Code section 13050, subdivision (l)(1) as, an alteration of the quality of the waters of the state by waste to a degree that unreasonably affects either waters of the state for beneficial use or facilities that serve these beneficial uses. Earthen material from construction of the stream crossings and land clearing and grading activities that occurred within or adjacent to the unnamed tributaries has discharged, and still has the potential to discharge, creating or threatening to create a condition of pollution by unreasonably affecting the beneficial uses of water of the state.

    a. Discharges of sediment and other inert material can alter the hydrologic and sediment transport regimes of surface waters by affecting the flow of water and establishment of vegetation. Such changes may lead to adverse conditions such as flooding, increases in suspended sediment and turbidity, accelerated erosion of the watercourse bed or banks, and localized accumulation of deleterious materials. Additionally, such discharges directly threaten wildlife habitat and aquatic species (beneficial uses impacted: RARE, MIGR, SPWN, COLD, COMM, and WILD). The unnamed tributaries provide habitat for amphibians and are tributary to streams that provide habitat for salmonids. Increased sedimentation and turbidity can also result in increased treatment and/or maintenance costs for downstream agricultural and municipal users that withdraw and treat the water (beneficial uses impacted: AGR and MUN). Sediment-laden storm water can also discharge to surface water and result in increased turbidity that may affect the recreational and aesthetic enjoyment of the surface waters (beneficial uses impacted: REC-1 and REC-2).

    b. The discharge of sediment and earthen material is especially problematic in the Mattole River and the South Fork Eel River because, as noted above, both waterbodies and their tributaries are Clean Water Act section 303(d)-listed as impaired due to elevated sedimentation/siltation and listed as impaired due to elevated temperature. Sediment delivery to streams impacts migration, spawning, reproduction, and early development of cold-water fish such as fall run Chinook salmon, Coho salmon, and steelhead trout.

    c. Sediment delivery to headwater streams is especially problematic for amphibian species. Sediment deposition (i.e. bottom deposits) in headwater streams can result in the direct impact to native amphibians that rely on clean substrate to burrow in and access cold, clean water, including Southern Torrent Salamanders, Coastal Giant Salamanders, and Tailed Frogs. Southern Torrent Salamanders are primarily aquatic, extremely moisture dependent, burrow into streambed substrates during both low and high stream flows, and feed largely on aquatic macroinvertebrates. Southern Torrents lay single eggs that take

approximately eight months to hatch, and their larvae take up to two and a half years to metamorphose.

d. Suspended sediment in surface waters can cause harm to aquatic organisms by abrasion of surface membranes, interference with respiration, and sensory perception in aquatic fauna. Suspended sediment can reduce photosynthesis in and survival of aquatic life by limiting the transmittance of light. As described above, the Basin Plan contains a water quality objective for sediment, which requires that the suspended sediment load and suspended sediment discharge rate of surface waters shall not be altered in such a manner as to cause nuisance or adversely affect beneficial uses. Suspended sediment can result in (1) increased turbidity (loss of clarity) resulting in decreased light transmittance, biological productivity, and aesthetic value; and (2) physical suffocation through burial of bottom dwelling (benthic) organisms, salmonid eggs, and alevin (newly spawned salmon or trout still carrying its yolk). Sediment can also physically damage gills causing fish mortality; increase physiological stress; reduce reproduction; impair normal feeding and predator avoidance behaviors, resulting in impacts to commercial and recreational fishing resources; increase water temperature; and fill in lagoons and wetlands converting them from aquatic to terrestrial habitat. These water quality impacts occur both during sediment transport and sediment deposition.

e. Sediment is also a known transport mechanism for toxics (e.g., metals and synthetic organics) and nutrients, which bind to sediment particles. (beneficial uses impacted: REC1, REC-2, COLD, SPWN, RARE, MIGR, COMM, MUN, and WILD).

f. Petroleum products used for lubricants and fuels including oil, diesel, and gasoline can enter waters through spills, leakage from storage containers, and improper storage and disposal and can result in contamination of freshwater sources. Spilled oil in freshwater habitats can affect mammals, aquatic birds, insects, fish, microorganisms and sensitive vegetation. Heavier petroleum products can sink and can become trapped in gravels, contributing to long-term exposures, while lighter petroleum products can accumulate on the surface of water and spread downstream where it can collect on stream beds, log jams, and at the water's edge. Petroleum products can also dissolve into the water column where it can be ingested by fish and other freshwater organisms. The actual behaviors of the product in water will depend on the characteristics of the petroleum product and that of the water body Amphibian exposure to petroleum products can be particularly detrimental as they breathe through their skin, and coating can be lethal. Oil and fuel exposure to fish can cause impaired functions, physical deformities, and compromised reproduction.

In addition, human exposure to petroleum products from ingestion and exposure can impact the central nervous system, eyes, and respiratory tract. (Beneficial Uses that are potentially impacted include: REC 1, REC-2, COLD, SPWN, RARE, MIGR, COMM, MUN, and WILD).

g. Discharges of excess nutrients, especially nitrates and phosphorus, can lead to eutrophication and algal blooms. Algal blooms can block light, clog fish gills, and cause an increase in biological oxygen demand as they die, severely lowering dissolved oxygen levels available to sustain aquatic ecosystems. Lowered dissolved oxygen concentrations can also provide favorable conditions for proliferation of pathogenic bacteria. In addition, excess nutrients can contribute to toxic algal blooms which create bioaccumulative toxins that can be deleterious to aquatic ecosystems and wildlife that may consume aquatic fauna (Beneficial Uses impacted: RARE, MIGR, WILD, COLD, COMM, and SPWN). Eutrophication and algal blooms can also affect the recreational and aesthetic enjoyment of surface waters. Direct exposure to toxic algae can lead to rashes, respiratory problems, and neurological effects in humans, and can raise costs for water treatment plants and contribute to harmful byproducts when treated (Beneficial Uses that are potentially impacted include: REC-1, REC-2, and MUN).

23. Cleanup and abatement is necessary to ensure that any discharge of waste or existing condition of pollution is cleaned up, that the threat of unauthorized discharges to waters of the state from the Property that may create a condition of pollution are prevented, that the background water quality or the best water quality that is feasible is restored, and that any impacts to beneficial uses are mitigated. The issuance of a cleanup and abatement order pursuant to Water Code section 13304 is appropriate and consistent with the policies of the North Coast Water Board and State Water Board.

Technical Reports Required

24. Water Code section 13267, subdivision (a) provides that the Regional Water Board, "in establishing or reviewing any water quality plan or waste discharge requirements, or in connection with any action relating to may investigate the quality of any water of the state within its region." Water Code section 13267, subdivision (b) provides that the Regional Water Board, in conducting an investigation, may require a discharger to furnish, under penalty of perjury, technical or monitoring program reports. The burden, including costs, of preparing these reports must bear a reasonable relationship to the need for the reports and the benefits to be obtained from the reports. This Order requires three types of technical and monitoring reports, including monthly progress reports, a completion report, and annual monitoring reports. Staff estimates the total cost of technical reports required by this Order to be approximately $18,240

to $56,880[3]. The costs of the technical or monitoring reports required by this Order bear a reasonable relationship to the need for these reports and the benefit to be gained by these reports, as discussed below:

a. The Monthly Progress Reports are periodic reports that the Dischargers must prepare to demonstrate and communicate progress on implementation of the CRMP. Monthly Progress Reports are necessary to ensure that the restoration and corrective actions are performed consistently with the approved CRMP and that implementation of the CRMP will be completed by the deadline contained in this Order. Timely implementation is crucial to ensure the Property is restored and erosion control measures are in place prior to the next winter season to prevent discharges of sediment into waters of the state. The cost of preparing a Monthly Progress Report is based on the cost estimated in the 2017 Direct Cost Analysis for report production of a Site Closure Report which is estimated to cost $120 an hour. Staff has estimated that it will take 4-8 hours to prepare a Monthly Progress Report, resulting in a cost between $480 and $960 per report, for a total cost between $6,240 and $12,480 to prepare thirteen (13) monthly reports during the construction season of May-October for the period of October 2026 through October 2029 while on-site remediation activities are required under the Order.

b. A Completion Report is necessary to demonstrate that the Dischargers have successfully completed implementation of the CRMP in a timely manner in accordance with this Order. The benefit derived from a Completion Report is the North Coast Water Board's, or its delegated officer's, ability to verify that remedial activities and best management practices were adequately implemented to ensure that cleanup and abatement activities remedy all water quality threats and impacts. The cost of a Completion Report (i.e., field inspection and report preparation) is comparable to the report preparation component of a combined Site Management Plan and Site Erosion and Sediment Control Plan as

[3] The State Water Board considered the estimated costs associated with various technical reports regarding site characterization, stabilization, and restoration during the adoption and amendment of the Cannabis Cultivation Policy and General Order. Estimated costs for technical reports were presented in the State Water Board's 2017 Direct Cost Analysis For the Proposed Cannabis Cultivation Policy (2017 Direct Cost Analysis) (waterboards.ca.gov/water_issues/programs/cannabis/docs/policy/20171017_cannabis_cultivation_policy_cost_analysis.pdf). The costs to develop the technical reports required in this Order are anticipated to be comparable to the preparation of reports presented in the 2017 Direct Cost Analysis, as detailed in Paragraph 24, subparagraphs a-d.

described in the 2017 Direct Cost Analysis described above, which are estimated to cost between $2,760 and $7,920 each. Therefore, the estimated cost to prepare the Completion Report is between $5,520 and $15,840.

c. Annual Monitoring Reports are necessary to allow the North Coast Water Board, or its delegated officer, to confirm the long-term stability of restored areas, to identify any areas where restoration is failing or needs improvement, and to demonstrate the effectiveness of erosion control measures in preventing sediment discharges to waters of the state. Given the condition of the Property as a result of the Dischargers' activities, observation and maintenance of the completed project for a period of three years is needed to ensure that the anticipated water quality benefits are achieved in the long-term and that CRMP components continue to function and remain effective. The cost to prepare an Annual Monitoring Report (i.e., field inspection and report preparation) are comparable to that of a Site Closure Report as presented in the 2017 Direct Cost Analysis, which is estimated to cost between $1,080-$4,760. Therefore, the cost to prepare six Annual Monitoring Reports, for years 2026-2031, is estimated to be between $6,480 to $28,560.

The Dischargers were appropriately named at the time of issuance of Order No. R1-2024-0047 and are responsible for compliance with this Order, and thus are appropriately responsible for providing these reports.

California Environmental Quality Act

25. Issuance of this Order is being taken for the protection of the environment and to enforce the laws and regulations administered by the North Coast Water Board and, as such, is exempt from provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) (Public Resources Code section 21000 et seq.) in accordance with California Code of Regulations, title 14, sections 15307, 15308, and 15321. To the extent that the Order requires minor alterations to land and/or earth-disturbing and re-vegetation activities not to exceed five acres in size and to assure restoration of stream habitat and prevent erosion, this Order is exempt from provisions of CEQA pursuant to California Code of Regulations, title 14, sections 15304 and 15333This Order generally requires the Dischargers to submit plans for approval prior to implementation of cleanup, abatement, and restoration activities at the Property. Mere submittal of plans is exempt from CEQA as submittal will not cause a direct or indirect physical change in the environment and/or is an activity that cannot possibly have a significant effect on the environment. CEQA review at this time would be premature and speculative, as there is simply not enough information concerning the Dischargers' proposed remedial activities and possible associated environmental impacts. If the North Coast Water Board determines that implementation of any plan required by this

Order will have a significant effect on the environment that is not otherwise exempt from CEQA, the North Coast Water Board will conduct the necessary and appropriate environmental review prior to implementation of the applicable plan. Should additional environmental review be required in connection with the requirements of this Order, the North Coast Water Board may recover costs associated with preparing and submitting any documents necessary for environmental review. If necessary, the Dischargers and a consultant acceptable to the North Coast Water Board shall enter into a memorandum of understanding with the North Coast Water Board regarding such costs prior to undertaking any environmental review.

REQUIRED ACTIONS

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, pursuant to Water Code sections 13267 and 13304, that the Dischargers shall clean up the wastes and abate the impacts to water quality in accordance with the scope and schedule set forth below and provide the following information:

1. **Modifications to the approved CRMP:** The Dischargers shall notify and provide rationale to the North Coast Water Board and obtain approval at least 60 days prior to making any modifications to the approved CRMP.
2. **By October 15, 2026,** The Dischargers shall begin implementation of the approved CRMP.
3. The Dischargers shall submit monthly progress reports beginning the first day of the month following implementation start date of the CRMP, through completion of cleanup, stabilization, restoration, and mitigation work. The monthly progress reports shall include photographs at each photo monitoring point, as depicted on site maps/figures.
4. **Implement the CRMP:** The Dischargers shall fully implement and complete the CRMP by October 15, 2029, and follow the scheduled activities described in the CRMP that includes annual activities, including initial implementation and cleanup in 2026, major construction, upgrades, and continued cleanup in 2027, final construction, decommissioning, and monitoring in 2028, and long-term monitoring and adaptive management in 2029, with a final deadline for all required cleanup, restoration and mitigation work by October 15, 2029.
5. **By October 15, 2029,** the Dischargers shall complete implementation of all the cleanup, restoration and mitigation work contained in the approved CRMP.
6. Within 60 days after fully implementing the CRMP, **but no later than December 15, 2029,** the Dischargers shall submit a Completion Report for the CRMP for approval by the North Coast Water Board or its delegated officer. The Completion Report shall include accurate depictions, documentation, and as-built designs of all completed restoration construction and/or abatement measures

included in the approved CRMP to demonstrate the CRMP has been fully implemented. This report shall also include pre- and post-construction photographs taken at each photo point, as depicted on site maps/figures.

7. Upon completion of the restoration and mitigation under the approved CRMP, submit annual monitoring reports by **January 31** of each year for at least three years or until the North Coast Water Board or its delegated officer approves a request to discontinue monitoring. Such a request may be submitted when the approved success criteria in the CRMP are met with supporting documentation. Each annual monitoring report shall include, at a minimum, a completed inspection checklist, photos of areas restored, a description of any locations where restoration is failing and/or needs to be corrected to achieve the success criteria.

GENERAL REQUIREMENTS AND NOTICES

1. **Duty to Use Qualified Professionals:** The Discharger shall provide documentation that identifies plans and reports required under this Order are prepared under the direction of appropriately qualified professionals. As required by the California Business and Professions Code sections 6735, 7835, and 7835.1, engineering and geologic evaluations and judgments shall be performed by or under the direction of registered professionals competent and proficient in the fields pertinent to the required activities. The Discharger shall include a statement of qualification and registration numbers of the responsible lead professionals in all plans and reports required under this Order. The lead professional shall sign and affix their registration stamp to the report, plan, or document. The required activities must be implemented by the appropriately qualified/licensed professional as otherwise required by law.
2. **Signatory Requirements**: All technical reports submitted by the Dischargers shall include a cover letter signed by the Dischargers, or a duly authorized representative, certifying under penalty of law that the signer has examined and is familiar with the report and that to his/her knowledge, the report is true, complete, and accurate. The Dischargers shall also state in the cover letter whether he/she will implement the recommendations/proposals provided in the report and the schedule for implementation.

   Any person signing a document submitted under this Order shall make the following certification:

   > *"I certify under penalty of law that I have personally examined and am familiar with the information submitted in this document and all attachments and that, based on my knowledge and on my inquiry of those individuals immediately responsible for obtaining the information, I believe that the information is true, accurate, and complete. I am aware that there*

are significant penalties for submitting false information, including the possibility of fine and imprisonment."

3. **Notice of Onsite Work:** The Dischargers, or a duly authorized agent, shall notify Staff at least 48 hours prior to any onsite work, testing, or sampling that pertains to environmental remediation and investigation and is not routine monitoring, maintenance, or inspection. The Dischargers shall contact Adona White at 707-576-2672 or by email Adona.White@waterboards.ca.gov.
4. **Notice of Change in Ownership or Occupancy**: The Dischargers shall file a written report on any changes in the Property's ownership or occupancy. This report shall be submitted to Staff no later than 30 days prior to a planned change and shall reference the number of this Order.
5. **Reasonable Access**: The Dischargers shall allow the North Coast Water Board and State Water Board, or an authorized representative, upon the presentation of credentials and other documents as may be required by law, to enter at reasonable times to inspect the Property and any records that must be kept under the conditions of this Order for the purposes of assuring compliance with this Order or as otherwise authorized by the Water Code.
6. **Submissions**: All monitoring reports, technical reports, or notices required under this Order shall be submitted to Staff at the addresses provided below. Staff will coordinate to obtain approval of the required submittals.

   By email (preferred) to: Adona White, Water Resource Control Engineer, Adona.White@waterboards.ca.gov
   Or by mail to:
   North Coast Regional Water Quality Control Board
   Attn: Adona White
   5550 Skylane Blvd, Suite A
   Santa Rosa, CA 95403
7. **Other Regulatory Requirements:** The Dischargers shall obtain all applicable local, state, and federal permits necessary to fulfill the requirements of this Order prior to beginning the work.
8. **Cost Recovery**: Pursuant to Water code section 13304, the State or Regional Water Board is entitled to all reasonable costs it actually incurs to investigate and abate the effects of unauthorized discharges of waste and to oversee/supervise the cleanup of such waste, or other restoration action, required by this Order. If requested by the North Coast Water Board or State Water Board, the Dischargers shall enroll in the State Water Board's Cost Recovery Program and shall reimburse the State of California for all reasonable costs actually incurred by the State Water Board and North Coast Water Board.
9. **Delayed Compliance**: If for any reason, the Dischargers are unable to perform any activity or submit any document in compliance with the schedule set forth

herein, or in compliance with any work schedule submitted pursuant to this Order and approved by the North Coast Water Board or its delegated officer, the Dischargers may request, in writing, an extension of the time specified. The extension request shall include justification for the delay. Any extension request shall be submitted as soon as a delay is recognized and prior to the compliance date. An extension may only be granted by modification of this Order or by a letter from the Executive Officer. The North Coast Water Board acknowledges that local, state, and federal permits may cause a delay beyond the control of the Dischargers and will take all the available relevant facts into consideration when considering whether or not to exercise its enforcement authority.

10. **Modifications**: Any modification to this Order shall be in writing and approved by the North Coast Water Board or its delegated officer including any potential extension requests.

11. **Enforcement Authority**: If the Dischargers fail to comply with the requirements of this Order, this matter may be referred to the Attorney General for judicial enforcement or a complaint for administrative civil liability may be issued by the North Coast Water Board. Failure to comply with this Order may result in the assessment of an administrative civil liability of up to $10,000 per violation per day and/or up to $10 per gallon when the violation results in the discharge of waste, pursuant to Water Code sections 13268, 13350, and/or 13385. The North Coast Water Board reserves its right to take any enforcement actions authorized by law, including, but not limited to, violation of the terms and conditions of this Order.

12. **No Limitation of Water Board Authority**: This Order in no way limits the authority of the North Coast Water Board to institute additional enforcement actions or to require additional investigation and cleanup of the Property consistent with the Water Code. This Order may be revised as additional information becomes available.

13. **Requesting Review by the State Water Board**: Any person aggrieved by this action of the North Coast Water Board may petition the State Water Board to review the action in accordance with Water Code section 13320 and California Code of Regulations, title 23, section 2050 et al. The State Water Board must receive the petition no later than 5:00 p.m., 30 days following the date of this Order, except that if the thirtieth day following the date of this Order falls on a Saturday, Sunday, or state holiday, the petition must be received on the next business day. Copies of the law and regulations applicable to filing petitions may be found on the Internet at: (http://www.waterboards.ca.gov/public_notices/petitions/water_quality) or will be provided upon request.

This Order is effective upon the date of signature.

Digitally signed by Valerie Quinto
Date: 2026.10.23 16:54:17 -07'00'

Water Boards

Valerie Quinto
Executive Officer

List of Enclosures:

Enclosure 1: September 30, 2026 North Coast Water Board Approval Letter for the Cleanup Restoration and Monitoring Plan for the Property, submitted to the North Coast Water Board on September 4, 2026

Enclosure 2: Cleanup Restoration and Monitoring Plan pursuant to Cleanup and Abatement Order No. R1-2024-0047, for Humboldt Assessor Parcel Numbers 220-292-015, 220-292-017 and 220-292-018, dated September 4, 2026, as prepared by Omsberg and Preston and ETA Humboldt

Enclosure 3: Cleanup and Abatement and Investigative Order No. R1-2024-0047, available electronically at: https://www.waterboards.ca.gov/northcoast/board_decisions/adopted_orders/pdf/2024/R1-2024-0047.pdf

Enclosure 4: Property Maps, HUM APNs 220-292-015, 220-292-017 and 220-292-018, available electronically at https://www.waterboards.ca.gov/northcoast/board_decisions/adopted_orders/pdf/2024/R1-2024-0047_Attach_1.pdf

Enclosure 5: June 17, 2022 North Coast Water Board Notice of Violation and Transmittal of Report of May 19, 2022 Inspection Report, available electronically at: https://www.waterboards.ca.gov/northcoast/board_decisions/adopted_orders/pdf/2022/lieberman_nov.pdf