

Beaches and Creeks TMDL Cost-Benefit Analysis
Steering Committee Meeting
March 22, 2017

Steering Committee Members Present

Jeremy Haas, San Diego Regional Water Quality Control Board
Jimmy Smith, San Diego Regional Water Quality Control Board
Todd Snyder, County of San Diego, Watershed Protection Program
Ruth Kolb, City of San Diego, Storm Water and Transportation
Rob Hutsel, San Diego River Park Foundation (participating via phone)
Chris Crompton, County of Orange, Stormwater Quality Planning
Jeff Van Every, City of San Diego Public Utilities Division

Supporting Roles

Natalia Hentschel, Katz & Associates
Bree Robertoy, Katz & Associates
Chad Praul, Environmental Incentives (participating via phone)
Helen Yu, San Diego Regional Water Quality Control Board
Jian Peng, County of Orange, Stormwater Quality Planning
Jo Ann Weber, County of San Diego
Vickie Kalkirtz, City of San Diego

CBA Communication Plan

The Steering Committee determined a plan is needed to guide communication about the Cost-Benefit Analysis (CBA) to various stakeholders. The Communication Plan will strategically outline how to communicate about the project by identifying the communication goal and objectives, audiences, communication challenges and opportunities, strategies and tactics.

The overall goals of the Communication Plan, as identified by the Steering Committee, are to:

- Describe the CBA process and its results in a simple way
- Communicate the implications of the CBA (e.g., changes that may result from the CBA)
- Provide a history of the CBA

Groups who will use the communication plan include Regional Water Board staff, copermitted staff and steering committee constituencies.

Communication Plan Development

The County of San Diego will fund development of the Communication Plan, including costs for a consultant to develop the Plan. The Steering Committee will oversee its development, make key decisions, and provide input on and review the Plan.

A subcommittee will be formed to guide the consultant in the preparation of the Communication Plan. Jeremy Haas of the Regional Water Board, Ruth Kolb or Vickie Kalkirtz of the City of San Diego, Chris

Crompton or Jian Peng of the County of Orange, and Todd Snyder of the County of San Diego volunteered to participate in the subcommittee, and additional volunteers were solicited. The subcommittee will check in with the Steering Committee via teleconferences.

The Communication Plan will be developed in two phases. Phase 1 will correspond with the public release of the draft CBA and will be completed by May 2017. Phase 2 will correspond with the release of the final CBA and will be completed before August 2017.

The table below shows initial lists of audiences, messages and strategies and tactics to be included in the Communication Plan as identified by the Steering Committee. Each component is additionally broken down by the two phases of the Plan. Messages, strategies and tactics will be developed for both the CBA and the Financial Capability Assessment (FCA) components of the report.

Communication Plan Component	Phase 1	Phase 2
Audiences	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Copermittees not represented on the Steering Committee • Industry members • General public • Non-Government Organizations 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Elected officials • Copermittees • Regional Water Board • General public • Non-Government Organizations • Media • Conference attendees • U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Messages	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What is the study? • How did the study come to be? • What feedback is requested from the public (i.e., meaningful input, no new data will be considered in calculations but may be addressed qualitatively)? 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What are the results of the CBA? • What are the implications of the CBA?
Strategies and Tactics		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A simple summary of the CBA report (e.g., cliff notes or Executive Summary) • Fact sheet(s) • Training presentation

The following are other general comments from the Steering Committee about the Communication Plan development process:

- C. Crompton: Vetting the Plan through each agency’s public information officers could slow the process down. It seems this group should agree on what we release and have core messages and training in place. Then, the dissemination will be done individually by agencies.
- J. Haas: Are fact sheets part of the existing consultant’s scope? I recall we discussed it.

- V. Kalkirtz: The City of San Diego Communications Department will have to review and approve a plan such as this before it can be used.
- C. Crompton: Phase 2 should outline what we do collectively and what we do individually to disseminate the information.
- T. Snyder: Certain members of my board are going to want to be briefed before this goes to public comment. I can come up with messages for that and will caveat that this is a draft document.
 - R. Kolb: It would be nice to ensure we are saying the same thing.
 - C. Crompton: We should wait until after public process before providing results. I don't think will get those questions from elected officials yet.
 - C. Praul: We could use the meeting on April 25 to harmonize messaging.

Observed Recreational Activities after Rainstorms at Ocean Beach

To gather information about who uses the beach after rain events, recreation activities were observed at Ocean Beach for a continuous eight hours 72 hours after three rain events. Observers estimated the duration of each activity and the age of each person observed. Activities were categorized by zones and whether head submersion occurred or not.

The following comments and questions were made by Steering Committee members regarding the observed recreational activity data:

- J. Smith: Stand-up paddle boarders should be included in the head submersion category.
- C. Crompton: Wading is walking through water and by definition does not involve head submersion. Children playing is not wading.
- T. Snyder: Based on the results, around 12 to 13 percent of REC-1 usage was outside of the demographic that was studied in the Surfer Health Study. Although, that figure may not be representative.
- J. Smith: Did Zone D include the pier (i.e., people fishing on the pier)?
 - J. A. Weber will check with the team who made the observations.
- C. Praul: One of the uses for these data is to compare rates of beach attendance to activities to see if the CBA matches with these observations. The types of activities on wet weather days are about 20 percent of total beach attendance. The data are pretty close to what is in the CBA. These results make me feel comfortable that we are making a reasonable estimate in the study. The other takeaway is that people are generally not exposing themselves to the fresh water, which is consistent with assumptions made in the study.
 - R. Hutsel: Much of that freshwater zone is protected, and you are not supposed to have contact with the water. Signs are posted on the dunes and it is pretty common knowledge. Also, during a rain event, it is unlikely someone would get in the water because of the current.
- J. Smith: Is there any information you regarding trends in days of use lost?
 - C. Praul: There is a recovery of average use as days increase after storm day.

Financial Capability Assessment

The Steering Committee discussed the status and implications of the Financial Capability Assessment (FCA), including what is required to extend the TMDL deadline and the schedule for reconsideration.

- J. Smith: My understanding is that the FCA is screening level and not subject to the same rigor as the CBA.
 - C. Praul: Correct. The FCA is showing the cost is a high proportion of the median income in San Diego. The FCA is needed for a schedule change, but the residential indicator score is most important to the EPA. The next six components are supporting information and additional analysis.
- J. Smith: The City of San Diego is interested in pursuing an integrated planning approach with utilities and wastewater. The EPA would want financial assurances.
 - T. Snyder: The City would merge wastewater and stormwater plans for compliance and schedules? Would that take place of a standalone document, or would it be an umbrella document?
 - R. Kolb: There would be three for the City of San Diego because it includes water utilities.
- C. Praul: Wastewater and stormwater can be merged easily because they are both subject to the Clean Water Act, but it is more difficult to incorporate source water because it is subject to the Safe Drinking Water Act.
- T. Snyder: Merging systems allows you to have longer compliance schedules and prioritize investments in one system over another through a unified plan and compliance schedule. The questions are: does the FCA apply to separate systems, and how would it apply to independent water districts? There are lots of related, proposed bills out there (e.g., SB 589, H.R. 465).
- T. Snyder: This is a decision the Regional Board can't make yet and needs EPA input about. We want to take the FCA to the next level, but we don't want to spend the money if it isn't necessary.
- J. Smith: The realization is that TMDLs are hard to meet, especially in wet weather. The Regional Board expects copermitees to include this in a TMDL reopener in some way. My desire would be to focus on a coordinated approach between wastewater and stormwater and give firm commitments to make improvements in water quality and beneficial use attainability.
- J. Haas: There are two overlapping approaches at work. The first would be if the FCA justifies a longer stormwater compliance date. The second would be if, through this process, we could have a better indicator or a better way to target sources that could achieve the same thing. It might be helpful to think of the two intersecting opportunities.

Schedule and Next Steps

- J. A. Weber will engage a consultant to develop the Communication Plan and coordinate the Communication Plan subcommittee.
- The Technical Advisory Committee will meet with the Steering Committee April 10 and 11 to provide feedback on the draft CBA.
- The next Steering Committee meeting is April 25.