

Water Board Response to Comments from Steve Ritchie, Executive Project Manager, South Bay Salt Pond Project

TO: San Francisco Bay Water Board		
FROM: Steve Ritchie, Executive Project Manager, South Bay Salt Pond Restoration Project		
DATE: July 16, 2008		
COMMENTS ON TENTATIVE ORDER FOR THE SBSRP, PHASE 1		
PAGE/SECTION NO.	COMMENT	WATER BOARD STAFF RESPONSE
p. 2 Finding 4	Recommend use of the word "uncertain" rather than "unclear"	Comment accepted and addressed
p. 2 Finding 5		Comment accepted and addressed
p. 2 Finding 7	Capitalize "South San Francisco Bay"	Comment accepted and addressed
p. 3 Finding 9	The tidal habitats in E8A/E9/E8X and A6 will take many years to evolve. The other Phase 1 actions are all constructed habitats. Insert the phrase "in Ponds A6 and E8A/E9/E8X" after the words "target habitats" in the last sentence.	Comment accepted and addressed
p. 4 Table 1	Footnote 2 should reference Pond A17. Replace "will not" with "are not expected to"	Comment accepted and addressed
p. 5 Finding 13	Insert the word "help" between also and protect in the next to last line.	Comment accepted and addressed
p. 6 Table 2	First Habitat Type should be either "Former Salt Ponds" or simply "Ponds"	Comment accepted and addressed
p. 6 Finding 16	Second sentence replace "pond complexes" with "Phase 1 action ponds"	Comment accepted and addressed
p. 7 Finding 17	Part of Finding appears to have a different font size.	Comment accepted and addressed
p. 7 Finding 18	In last sentence, recommend replace "will" with "is expected to".	Comment accepted and addressed
p. 8 Finding 20	Add "Alviso Slough Restoration Project" to the list of projects.	Comment accepted and addressed
p. 9 Finding 22	Not clear why ESLs are even mentioned. Recommend delete the last 3 sentences.	Comment accepted and addressed
p. 13 Finding 32	Fourth line replace "modified operation" with "replacement".	Comment accepted and addressed
p. 14 Finding 33	Modify the third sentence to read "The nearby staging area will support 58 motor vehicles and is being built..."	Comment accepted and addressed
p. 14 Finding 34	Delete last sentence. The sentence relates to an earlier trail alignment.	Comment accepted and addressed
p. 15 Finding 38	Fifth line insert the word "unrestricted" before the phrase "tidal action".	Comment accepted and addressed
p. 17 Finding 42	Ponds B1 and B2 should be referred to as AB1 And AB2.	Comment accepted and addressed
p. 18 Table 6	In Footnote 1 delete "proposes to" and change "operate" to "operates".	Comment accepted and addressed
p. 18 Finding 44	Line 9 delete "the" from before "Alviso Slough"	Comment accepted and addressed
p. 19 Finding 46	Revise the last sentence to conclude "Cargill is expected to continuing operating these ponds as seasonal ponds until their transfer to USFWS in 2011." Add a new last sentence that says, "After the transfer, the USFWS is expected to continue to operate them as seasonal ponds."	Comment accepted and addressed
p. 21 Finding 49	Line 9 capitalize Pond.	Comment accepted and addressed

Water Board Response to Comments from Steve Ritchie, Executive Project Manager, South Bay Salt Pond Project

p. 23 Finding 54	Should spell out parts per thousand once.	Change not made since "parts per thousand" was already spelled out in Finding # 43.
p. 24 Finding 57	First line delete comma after "Oxygen".	Comment accepted and addressed
p. 25 Finding 58	Second line should read "monitoring data show"	Comment accepted and addressed
p. 26 Finding 61	Tenth line delete the word "a".	Comment accepted and addressed
p. 26 Finding 64	Third line replace "those" with "that".	Comment accepted and addressed
p. 29 Finding 73	Delete IND, NAV, and REC-1. Even though those are beneficial uses of the South Bay, they are not beneficial uses of the ponds.	Changes not made because these are the beneficial uses listed in the Basin Plan that pertain to the water bodies affected by the project, not only of the specific project area. The existing beneficial uses pertain to the restored ponds, the sloughs, and the receiving waters and are designated to protect against water quality degradation. Regarding the Navigation beneficial use, existing and anticipated uses are limited to small craft, such as kayaks. Including this beneficial use is not intended to allow larger vessels into the project area .
p. 30 Finding 77	Modify font of italicized phrase to standard font unless the emphasis is critical.	Comment accepted and addressed
p. 30 Finding 78	Third line delete extra period.	Comment accepted and addressed
p. 30 Finding 78	Adaptive Management is part of the Project as opposed to mitigation. Rewrite as "after mitigation and incorporating adaptive management".	Comment accepted and addressed
p. 32 Finding 83	Fifth line delete "project".	Comment accepted and addressed
p. 32 Finding 83	Sixth line replace "in" with "via".	Comment accepted and addressed
p. 32 Finding 84	Add a period at the end of the last sentence.	Comment accepted and addressed
p. 34 Finding 89 g.	Add a period at the end of the last sentence.	Comment accepted and addressed
p. 36 Finding 95	Delete the Note. The Draft Monitoring Plan is included.	Comment accepted and addressed
p. 36 finding 96	Last sentence insert the phrase "in decision making with the Project's Management Team" after "BCDC,".	Comment accepted and addressed
p. 38 Finding 108	Fifth line insert "County Water District" after "Alameda".	Comment accepted and addressed
p. 38 Finding 108	Sixth line replace "groundwater overdraft from" with "groundwater contamination via".	Comment accepted and addressed
p. 39 Finding 109	Not sure that increased salinity will reach the unconfined portion of the referenced Subbasin.	Comment accepted and addressed
p. 39 Prohibition 3	Delete the word "additional".	Comment accepted and addressed
p. 43 Provision 5	Delete (EO). All other references spell it out.	Comment accepted and addressed

p. 43 Provision 8	Sixth line don't understand the reference "subsequent to the issuance of the BOs".	Water Board staff expected to review the FWS and NMFS Biological Opinions before recommending this item for approval. Since those reports may not be available until after this draft Order is finalized, we reserve the right to change the monitoring program based on the opinions of those 2 agencies.
p. 44 Provision 11	Fifth line replace "their levees breached" with "restoration initiated". Breaching implies full tidal restoration.	Comment accepted and addressed
p. 45 Provision 14	Some of the Phase 1 actions are experiments in the utility of certain constructed habitats by bird species. We anticipate using an RFP process to carry out the experiments after habitat construction. This provision doesn't appear inconsistent with that approach, but this should be confirmed.	The provision that at the end of the monitoring period a wetland (or related habitat) functional assessment will be conducted at the project sites is not inconsistent with experiments conducted to determine the use of habitats by different species. In fact, a functional assessment should help in determining the quality of the constructed habitats.
p. 46 Provision 19	First line on page replace "System" with "Complex".	Comment accepted and addressed
p. 48 Provision 32	Second line insert "or the Discharger's contractor".	Comment accepted and addressed
p. 52 Provision 44Bj	Delete last sentence. Not sure what mounds are referenced.	Comment accepted and addressed
p. 53 Provision 52a	Delete extraneous "to"	Comment accepted and addressed
Figure 1	Labels for Eden Landing Ponds E8 and E8X are reversed. New figure will be provided.	Comment accepted and addressed
Table B-1	Pond A16 column should be a little wider to allow "Reconfiguration" to fit on on one line.	Comment accepted and addressed
Table B-1 line 48	Change font of X in the SF2 column.	Comment accepted and addressed
Table B-3	May use material from internal levee lowering to cap placed fill.	Comment accepted and addressed. We added "or material from internal levee lowering" to "Imported material to cap placed fill"
Table B-5	Bayfront levee maintenance yardage estimate should be 31,200 not 2,300.	Comment accepted and addressed
TO: San Francisco Bay Water Board		
FROM: Steve Ritchie, Executive Project Manager, South Bay Salt Pond Restoration Project		
DATE: July 21, 2008		
PAGE/SECTION NO.	COMMENT	WATER BOARD STAFF RESPONSE
pg 16, Finding 41	Modify residence times in Table 4	Comment accepted and addressed
pg 17, Finding 42	Modify residence times in Table 5	Comment accepted and addressed
pg 17, Finding 43	Modify residence times in Table 6	Comment accepted and addressed
pg 18, Finding 44	Modify residence times in Table 7	Comment accepted and addressed
pg 18, Finding 44	Modify residence times in Table 8	Comment accepted and addressed