TABLE 2
COMPARISON OF VIABLE
REMEDIAL ACTION
ALTERNATIVES

Description of Alternative	Human Health and Environment	Compliance with RAOs	Short and Long Term Effectiveness	Treatment Reliability	Implement-ability	Cost	Regulatory and Community Acceptance	Total Ranking
Alternative 6a	Is protective of human health and the environment.	Compliance with RAOs	May have long term effectivness issues if cap integrity is	Dredging and capping are proven technologies.	May be difficult due to low water conditions, limited access, and equipment restrictions.	Relatively moderate cost.	Dredging and capping is the preferred alternative of RWQCB staff due to streamlined permitting process. However, the Mosquito Abatement District may have concerns over long term O & M dredging of Slough channel.	
Mechanical Dredging to a Depth of Three Feet with Silt Screen, Landfill Disposal, Capping, and Institutional Controls	3	3	3	4	4	4	5	26
Alternative 6b	Is protective of human health and the environment.	Compliance with RAOs	May have long term effectivness issues if cap integrity is compromised.	Dredging and capping are proven technologies.	Difficult to treat large volume of decant water. Limited capacity of the onsite treatment system. May be difficult to implement due to two separate construction/remediation activities for each portion of the slough. Timing would be critical given constraints due to presence of endangered species.	Relatively moderate cost.	Dredging and capping is the preferred alternative of RWQCB staff due to streamlined permitting process. However, the Mosquito Abatement District may have concerns over long term O & M dredging of slough channel.	
Hydraulic Dredging to a Depth of Three Feet with Silt Screen, Landfill Disposal, Capping, and Institutional Controls	3	3	3	4	2	3	4	22
Alternative 7a	Is protective of human health and the environment.	Compliance with RAOs	May have long term effectivness issues if cap integrity in south Slough is	Dredging and capping are proven technologies.	Extremely complicated and difficult to implement	Relatively high cost.	Due to the innovative nature of this project, it may take longer to obtain regulatory approval.	
Partial Re-Alignment of the Peyton Slough (North of the Levee), Dredging and Capping the South Slough, Capping and Backfilling of the North Slough, Restoration of Marsh, and Institutional Controls	4	3	4	4	1	1	4	21
Alternative 7b	Is protective of human health and the environment.	Compliance with RAOs	Secure in long term effectiveness. Significantly reduces the potential for recontamination.	Dredging and capping are proven technologies.	Access may be difficult	Relatively high to moderate cost.	Due to the innovative nature of this project, it may take longer to obtain regulatory approval. This alternative provides the greatest flexibility with regard to future O&M dredging by the Mosquito Abatement District and is preferred by the trustees of the Shell Marsh Restoration Advisory Committee.	
Full Re-Alignment of the Peyton Slough, Capping and Backfilling of the Existing Slough Alignment, Restoration of Marsh, and Institutional Controls	5	5	5	4	3	2	5	29