
State Water Resources Control Board

9/17/2014

State Water Resources Control Board
Division of Water Quality
Victoria A. Whitney, Deputy Director
P.O. Box 100
Sacramento, CA 95812

Dear Ms. Whitney:

EXTERNAL PEER REVIEW OF PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO THE WATER QUALITY CONTROL PLAN FOR CALIFORNIA OCEAN WATERS TO ADDRESS DESALINATION FACILITY INTAKES, BRINE DISCHARGES, AND TO INCORPORATE OTHER NONSUBSTANTIVE CHANGES

This letter responds to the attached June 18, 2014 request for external scientific peer review for the subject noted above. The review process is described below. All steps were conducted in confidence. Reviewers' identities were not disclosed.

To begin the process for selecting reviewers, I contacted the University of California, Berkeley (University) and requested recommendations for candidates considered qualified to perform the assignment. The University was provided with the June 18, 2014 request letter to me, and attachments, and no additional material was asked for, nor forwarded to augment the request. This service by the University includes interviews of each promising candidate and is supported through an Interagency Agreement co-signed by Cal/EPA and the University.

Each candidate who was both interested and available for the review period was asked to complete a Conflict of Interest (COI) Disclosure form and send it to me for review, with Curriculum Vitae. The cover letter for the COI form describes the context for COI concerns that must be taken into consideration when completing the form. "As noted, staff will use this information to evaluate whether a reasonable member of the public would have a serious concern about [the candidate's] ability to provide a neutral and objective review of the work product."

In subsequent letters to candidates approved as reviewers, I provided the attached January 7, 2009 Supplement to the Cal/EPA Peer Review Guidelines, which, in part serves two purposes: a) it provides guidance to ensure confidentiality through the course of the external review, and, b) it notes reviewers are under no obligation to discuss their comments with third-parties after reviews have been submitted. We recommend they do not. All outside parties are provided opportunities to address a proposed regulatory action, or potential basis for such, through a well-defined rulemaking process.

Later, I sent each reviewer a detailed cover letter to initiate the review (Copies attached). The letter identified documents to be reviewed, all of which were provided through a secure FTP site. The site also included all references used in preparation of the proposal.

One of the documents at the FTP site was your June 18, 2014 request for reviewers to me. Its Attachment 2 was highlighted as the focus for the review. Each reviewer was asked to address each topic, as expertise allows, in the order given. Thirty days were provided for the review. I also asked reviewers to direct enquiring third-parties to me after they have submitted their reviews.

Reviewers' names, affiliations, curriculum vitae, and reviews are being sent to you now with this letter. All attachments can be electronically accessed through the bookmark icon at the left of the screen.

Approved reviewers are as follows:

- 1) Ben R. Hodges, Ph.D.
Associate Professor, Environmental and Water Resource Engineering
Department of Civil, Architectural and Environmental Engineering
University of Texas at Austin ECJ 8.208
301 E. Dean Keeton Street
Austin, Texas 78712

Telephone: (512) 471-4730
Facsimile: (512) 471-0592
Email: Hodges@utexas.edu

- 2) Lisa A. Levin, Ph.D.
Distinguished Professor
Integrative Oceanography Division
Scripps Institution of Oceanography
University of California San Diego
9500 Gilman Drive, #0218
La Jolla, CA 92093-0218

Telephone: (858) 534-3579
Facsimile: (858) 822-0562
Email: Llevin@ucsd.edu

- 3) E. Eric Adams, Ph.D.
Senior Lecturer and Senior Research Engineer
Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering, MIT,
Room 48-216-B
15 Vassar Street
Cambridge, MA 02139

Telephone: (219)-253-6596
Email: eeadams@mit.edu

- 4) Bronwyn Gillanders, Ph.D.
Professor, Ecology and Evolutionary Biology
University of Adelaide
SA 5005
Australia

Telephone: 011-61-8-8313-6235
Facsimile: 011-61-8-8313-4364
Email: Bronwyn.gillanders@adelaide.edu.au

- 5) Robert Howarth, Ph.D.
Professor of Ecology and Environmental Biology
College of Agriculture and Life Sciences
Cornell University
E309 Corson Hall
Ithaca, N.Y. 14853

Telephone: (607) 255-6175
Facsimile: (607) 255-8088
Email: howarth@cornell.edu

- 6) Nathan Knott, Ph.D.
Research Scientist, Fisheries NSW, NSW Department of Primary Industries
Senior Fellow, School of Biological Sciences, University of Wollongong
P.O. Box 89
Huskisson NSW 2540

Telephone: 011-61-2-4428-3002
Facsimile: 011-61-2-4441-7756
Email: nathan.knott@dpi.nsw.gov.au

- 7) Scott A. Socolofsky, Ph.D.
Associate Professor and Division Head
Coastal and Ocean Engineering Division
Zachary School of Engineering
Texas A & M University
CE/TTI 801B
College Station, TX 77843-3136

Telephone: 979-845-4517
Facsimile: 979-862-8162
Email: socolofs@tamu.edu

If you have questions, or require clarification from the reviewers, please contact me directly.

Regards,



Gerald W. Bowes, Ph.D.
Manager, Cal/EPA Scientific Peer Review Program
Office of Research, Planning and Performance
State Water Resources Control Board
1001 "I" Street, 16th Floor
Sacramento, California 95814

Telephone: (916) 341-5567

Fax: (916) 341-5284

Email: Gerald.Bowes@waterboards.ca.gov

Attachments

- 1) June 18, 2014 Request by Victoria A. Whitney for Scientific Peer Review
- 2) Letters to Reviewers Initiating the Review
 - a) Ben R. Hodges, Ph.D., University of Texas
 - b) Lisa A. Levin, Ph.D., University of California San Diego
 - c) E. Eric Adams, Ph.D., MIT
 - d) Bronwyn Gillanders, Ph.D., University of Adelaide
 - e) Robert Howarth, Ph.D., Cornell University
 - f) Nathan Knott, Ph.D., University of Wollongong
 - g) Scott A. Socolofsky, Ph.D., Zachary School of Engineering
- 3) January 7, 2009 Supplement to Cal/EPA Peer Review Guidelines
- 4) Curriculum Vitae:
 - a) Ben R. Hodges, Ph.D., University of Texas
 - b) Lisa A. Levin, Ph.D., University of California San Diego
 - c) E. Eric Adams, Ph.D., MIT
 - d) Bronwyn Gillanders, Ph.D., University of Adelaide
 - e) Robert Howarth, Ph.D., Cornell University
 - f) Nathan Knott, Ph.D., University of Wollongong
 - g) Scott A. Socolofsky, Ph.D., Zachary School of Engineering
- 5) Reviews:
 - a) Ben R. Hodges, Ph.D., University of Texas
 - b) Lisa A. Levin, Ph.D., University of California San Diego
 - c) E. Eric Adams, Ph.D., MIT
 - d) Bronwyn Gillanders, Ph.D., University of Adelaide
 - e) Robert Howarth, Ph.D., Cornell University
 - f) Nathan Knott, Ph.D., University of Wollongong
 - g) Scott A. Socolofsky, Ph.D., Zachary School of Engineering

ec: