



GAVIN NEWSOM
GOVERNOR



JARED BLUMENFELD
SECRETARY FOR
ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

State Water Resources Control Board

April 4, 2019

James Smith
Assistant Executive Officer
San Diego Regional Water Quality Control Board
2375 Northside Drive, Suite 100
San Diego, California 92018

SUBJECT: REQUEST FOR EXTERNAL PEER REVIEW OF THE SAN DIEGO WATER BOARD'S DRAFT BASIN PLAN AMENDMENT TO INCORPORATE NUMERIC BIOLOGICAL OBJECTIVES FOR STREAMS

Dear Mr. Smith,

This letter responds to the attached November 30, 2018 request for external scientific peer review for the subject noted above. The review process is described below. All steps were conducted in confidence. Reviewers' identities were not disclosed.

To begin the process for selecting reviewers, I contacted the University of California, Berkeley (University) and requested recommendations for candidates considered qualified to perform the assignment. This service is supported through an Interagency Agreement co-signed by CalEPA and the University. The University was provided with the request letter and attachments. No additional material was asked for, or provided. The University interviews each promising candidate.

Each candidate who was both qualified and available for the review period was asked to complete a Conflict of Interest (COI) Disclosure form and send it to me for review, with Curriculum Vitae. The cover letter for the COI form describes the context for COI concerns that must be taken into consideration when completing the form. "As noted, staff will use this information to evaluate whether a reasonable member of the public would have a serious concern about [the candidate's] ability to provide a neutral and objective review of the work product."

In subsequent letters to candidates approved as reviewers, I provided the attached October 22, 2018 Supplement to the CalEPA External Scientific Peer Review Guidelines, which, in part, serves two purposes: a) it provides guidance to ensure confidentiality through the course of the external review, and b) it notes reviewers are under no obligation to discuss their comments with third-parties after reviews have been submitted. We recommend they do not. All outside parties are provided opportunities to address a proposed regulatory action, or potential basis for such, through a well-defined rulemaking process.

E. JOAQUIN ESQUIVEL, CHAIR | EILEEN SOBECK, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

1001 I Street, Sacramento, CA 95814 | Mailing Address: P.O. Box 100, Sacramento, CA 95812-0100 | www.waterboards.ca.gov

Later, I sent letters to reviewers to initiate the review. These letters provided access instructions to a secure FTP site where all material to be reviewed was placed. Attachment 2 to the request memorandum was highlighted as the focus for the review. Each reviewer was asked to address each topic, as expertise allows, in the order given. Thirty days were provided for the review. I also asked reviewers to direct enquiring third-parties to me after they have submitted their reviews.

Reviewers' names, affiliations, curriculum vitae, initiating letters and reviews are being sent to you now with this letter.

Approved reviewers:

1. Yong Cao, Ph.D.
Staff Scientist, Prairie Research Institute
Illinois Natural History Survey
University of Illinois
1816 South Oak Street
Champaign, IL 61820

Telephone: (217) 244-6847
E-mail: yongcao@illinois.edu
2. Patrick Edwards, Ph.D.
Assistant Professor, Environmental Science and Management
Director, The Environmental Professional Program
Portland State University
PO Box 751
Portland, OR 97207

Telephone: (503) 725-8303
E-mail: patrick.edwards@pdx.edu
3. David A. Lytle, Ph.D.
Professor, Department of Integrative Biology
College of Science, Oregon State University
3029 Cordley Hall
Corvallis, OR 97331

Telephone: (541) 737-1068
E-mail: lytleada@oregonstate.edu
4. Wendy A. Monk, Ph.D.
Research Scientist with Environment and Climate Change Canada
Canadian Rivers Institute
Faculty of Forestry and Environmental Management
University of New Brunswick
Fredericton, NB, Canada

Telephone: (506) 452-6212
E-mail: wmonk@unb.ca

If you have any questions, or require clarification from the reviewers, please contact me directly.

Regards,



Gerald W. Bowes, Ph.D.
Manager, Cal/EPA Scientific Peer Review Program
Office of Research, Planning and Performance
State Water Resources Control Board
1001 "I" Street, 16th Floor Sacramento, California 95814

Telephone: (916) 341-5567

Email: GBowes@waterboards.ca.gov

cc: Chad.Loflen@waterboards.ca.gov
San Diego Water Board

Adriana.Nunez@waterboards.ca.gov
Office of Chief Counsel

- Attachments: (1) November 30, 2018 Request by James Smith for Scientific Peer Review
- (2) Letters to Reviewers Initiating the Review
 - (a) Yong Cao, Ph.D.
 - (b) Patrick Edwards, Ph.D.
 - (c) David A. Lytle, Ph.D.
 - (d) Wendy A. Monk, Ph.D.
 - (3) October 22, 2018 Supplement to Cal/EPA External Scientific Peer Review Guidelines
 - (4) Curriculum Vitae
 - (a) Yong Cao, Ph.D.
 - (b) Patrick Edwards, Ph.D.
 - (c) David A. Lytle, Ph.D.
 - (d) Wendy A. Monk, Ph.D.
 - (5) Reviews
 - (a) Yong Cao, Ph.D.
 - (b) Patrick Edwards, Ph.D.
 - (c) David A. Lytle, Ph.D.
 - (d) Wendy A. Monk, Ph.D.