# Using the Southern California IBI (Index of Biological Integrity) to Inform Clean Water Act Impairments

#### Alison Lipman, Ph.D. Stream Team Manager Heal the Bay, Santa Monica 28 October 2009



### Outline

- Heal the Bay's Stream Team
- Citizen Monitoring
- Stream Team "Wins"
- Bioassessment Program
- Bioassessment Informs Legislation







Heal the Bay's Stream Team is a citizen based program that works in the Santa Monica Bay (focusing on the Malibu Creek) watershed. Its objectives are to determine and promote the environmental health of the watershed :

- collect high quality useable data.
- monitor stream and water quality conditions.
- restore stream and riparian habitats.
- inform local and state-wide legislation related to water and stream quality.



### Malibu Creek Watershed





### Malibu Creek Watershed

#### **Monitoring Sites**





### **Stream Team Programs**

### Stream Walk

### Citizen Monitoring

- 1. Water Quality Testing
- 2. Stream Watch
- 3. Bioassessment
- Habitat Restoration







### Stream Walk (1999 – 2003)

Stream Team mapped:

- Discharge Points and Outfalls
- Unstable Bank Conditions
- Artificial Streambank Modifications
- Impacting Land Uses
- Large Patches of Invasive Vegetation
- Barriers to Fish Passage
- Illegal Dump Sites





### **Citizen Monitoring**

#### Water Quality Testing

#### High Quality Data

- Bacteria (total coliform, *E. coli*, *Enterococcus*)
- Nutrients (NO<sub>3</sub>+NO<sub>2</sub>-N, NH<sub>3</sub>-N, PO<sub>4</sub>)
- pH
- Dissolved Oxygen
- Turbidity
- Conductivity
- Air & water temperature
- Algae
- Inform the Public
- Regulation





# **Citizen Monitoring**

Water Quality Testing - Stream Team "Wins"

- Influenced provisions in The City of Malibu Local Coastal Program (LCP)
   > stronger plan with adequate setbacks
- Malibu bacteria TMDL
- Malibu trash TMDL
- Malibu nutrient TMDL





### **Bioassessment Sampling**



2000-2006 (California Stream Bioassessment Protocol - CSBP) 2008-2009 (SWAMP, 2007 SOP)

- Benthic macroinvertebrate (BMI) data: IBI Score
- **Physical habitat data** 
  - > High quality data, inform the public, legislation



Site	Spring 2000	Fall 2000	Spring 2001	Fall 2001	Spring 2002	Fall 2002	Spring 2003	Fall 2003	Winter 2005	Spring 2006	Fall 2006	Spring 2008	Winter 2008	Spring	
Arroyo Sequit															
AS19				70	72	66	72	70	64		57	49			
Cheeseboro Creek														222222	
CH6			59	57	64		49		54		43	2022/2022/2022/2022			
Cold Creek												111111111111111111		22222	
CC11	54	46		54	49		40				47			5.200	
CC11A			56											Success:	
CC2	36		46	73	53		44		27		31				
CC2 dup									36		41			Sec. 2	
CC3	80	76	92	76	83	80	84	64	60		73	74		1.1.1.1.1	
Lachusa Creek														2022202	
LCH18				73	72	76	54	61	54		11				
Las Virgenes Creek															
LV13					26	24	21	27	11		19				
LV13 LV17			72	53	20	24	21	21			19				
LV5	29	34	33	33	39	26	20	29	17		14				
LV5 LV5A	29		21		37	20	20	27	19		17				
LV5A2			21	40					19					2002200	
LV3A2 LV9				-10	59	26	46		34		34				
217						20	40				54				
LV26											54		RW= 24, TR= 21		
Malibu Creek															
MC1	16	24		39	19		26	23	26		26	21			
MC1B	10	24	26	57			20	25	20		20	21			
MC12		23	20		33	27	21	31	20		17				
MC12A		25	20	37		21	21	51	20			200000000000000000000000000000000000000			
MC12A MC13		39	20	51											
MC15					40	24	34	23			17			10000000	
MCI3 MC8	36	37			40	24		23			17				
MC8B		23													
MC8B MC9	33	17	24	43											
MC9 MC20		17	24	43						3					
MC20 MC21										4		29			
MC21 Medea Creek										4		29			
Medea Creek MD7	23	26	19	34	23	17	9	9	14		16				
MD7 MDC21	23	20	19	34	23	17	9	<u> </u>	14		16				
MDC21 Palo Comado Canyon											10				
Palo Comado Canyon PC16		A	60						40						
			00						40						
Solstice Creek	-			07	70	77	67	70	63		60				
SC14				87	76	76	67	70	63	64	60	44			
SC22										64					
SC23										71					
Stokes Creek									0.1		<b>F</b> <sup>4</sup>	0-10 =	• "very po	or"	
STC16					34				34		51		" <u> </u>		
Triunfo Creek												20-39	20-39 = "poor" 40-59 = "fair" 60-79 = "good" 80-100 = "very good		
TR17					19		4		0		20	40-50	=  "fair"		
TR10	20		19										"1"		
West Carlysle Creek												60-79	= good		
WC15	-		57									80-10	o = "verv	good'	
WC10							51								
Stone Creek															



- 303(d) List of Impaired Water Bodies (LA Regional Board)
- **National Pollutant Discharge Elimination** System (NPDES) Permits

2 examples:

- Ventura MS4 (LA Regional Board)
- Construction General Permits (CA State Board)



### Clean Water Act (CWA)



303(d) List of Impaired Water Bodies – Background

(EPA Watershed Academy Web: Introduction to the Clean Water Act, epa.gov/watertrain/cwa, 2009)

- "If monitoring and assessment indicate that for some uses and/or parameters, a waterbody or segment is not meeting WQS, then that water is considered "impaired" and goes on a special list called the "303(d) list," named after the section of the CWA that calls upon states, approved tribes, and territories to create such lists."
- "Current EPA regulations call for 303(d) lists to include only waters impaired by "pollutants," not those impaired by other types of "pollution" (altered flow and/or channel modification)."
- "If, however, biological monitoring indicates there is impairment of aquatic life uses, but it is not clear whether a pollutant is at least one of the reasons, the waters should be on the 303(d) list, and further analysis to identify the causes are needed."



303(d) List – Listings based on Bioassessment Data

- Los Angeles Regional Water Quality Control Board (Region 4) approved 303(d) List, posted Sep 21, 2009
- Now in review at State Board then EPA
- Listing would not have occurred without Heal the Bay solicitation (letters, comments, meetings, presentation) and submittal of IBI data (2007)
- Data collected by Heal the Bay and other stakeholders





#### 303(d) List – Listings based on Bioassessment Data

#### **TMDL Required List**

- Arroyo Seco Reach 1 (BMI)
- Compton Creek (BMI)
- Las Virgenes Creek (BMI & Invasive spp.)
- Lindero Creek Reach 1 (BMI & Invasive spp.)
- Malibu Creek (BMI & Invasive spp.)
- Medea Creek Reach 2 (BMI & Invasive spp.)
- Santa Clara River Reach 6 (BMI, Copper, Iron)
- Triunfo Canyon Creek Reach 2 (BMI)
- Walnut Creek Wash (BMI, Indicator Bacteria)

#### Do not Delist from 303(d) List

Malibu Lagoon (Benthic community effects)





#### 303(d) List – Heal the Bay Solicitation

IBI scores should be considered in the listing/delisting process.

- They qualify as applicable listing factors in sections 3.9 and 3.11 of the Listing Policy (Water Quality Control Policy For Developing California's CWA Section 303(d) List).
- IBI scores are the best available data to make listing decisions for biological community impairment in streams and rivers (required in section 3.9).
- Water segments with IBI data in the poor and very poor ranges (below 39) meet the listing factors in sections 3.9 and 3.11.
- Inherently, the IBI scoring system compares monitoring site conditions to reference sites (baseline conditions required in section 3.10).
- Many reaches in CA have poor IBI scores.



303(d) List – Heal the Bay Solicitation

	Malibu Creek 1	Malibu Creek 12	Malibu Creek 15	Las Virgenes 5	Las Virgenes 9	Medea 7	Triunfo 17	Cold Creek 3 (reference)
Spring 2000	16			29		23		80
Fall 2001	24	23		34		26		76
Spring 2001	26	20		33		19		92
Fall 2001	39	37		33		34		76
Spring 2002	19	33	40	39	59	23	19	83
Fall 2002		27	24	26	26			80
Spring 2003	26	21	34	20	46	9	4	84
Fall 2003	23	31	23	29		9		64
Winter 2005	26	20		17	34	14	0	60
Spring 2006								
Fall 2006	26	17	17	14	34	16	20	73

Malibu Creek Watershed IBI Scores. Source: Heal the Bay.

0–19 = "very poor" 20–39 = "poor" 40–59 = "fair" 60-79 = "good" 80–100 = "very good"



#### 303(d) List – Conclusion

#### Process

- Passed by LA Regional Board
- Needs to be approved by State Board and EPA
- Special studies or analysis of existing data to determine pollutant
- Create TMDLs
- In conjunction with TMDLs, there will need to be an IBI goal
  - What will this look like??

#### We need YOUR help to get these listings approved!

- > We need support letters when this comes before the State Board.
- If interested please see me after, and I will collect a list of contacts to email with action items.





#### NPDES Stormwater Program - Background

**Regulation of Point Sources** 

- The CWA makes it illegal to discharge pollutants from a point source to waters of the US
- Section 402 of the CWA creates the NPDES regulatory program
- Dischargers must obtain a discharge permit from proper authority
- Dischargers include: MS4s, Construction Activities, and Industrial Activities
- Permits set limits on various pollutants that can be discharged per given time
- Most states are authorized to implement NPDES program



#### NPDES Permits – Bioassessment Requirements

- Bioassessment monitoring requirements
  - To determine if discharge contributes to exceedances
  - Will hopefully lead to more 303(d) listings
- Last couple of years more permits are incorporating bioassessment monitoring, at least in the Los Angeles region.
- Heal the Bay advocacy has increased the frequency and # of locations where bioassessment is required.
- Ventura MS4 permit
- Construction General Permits



#### Ventura County 2008 MS4 Permits - Background

- Municipal Separate Storm Sewer Systems (MS4)
- California Regional Water Quality Control Board, Los Angeles Region
- Updates approved May 2009, expires May, 2014
- Permittees: Ventura County Watershed Protection District (principal permittee), County of Ventura, and the incorporated cities therein
- Regulates stormwater (wet weather) and non-stormwater (dry weather) from the MS4



Ventura County MS4 Permit – Bioassessment Requirements

- Principal permittee is a member of the Southern California Coastal Water Research Project (SCCWRP) Commission.
- Consents to participate in the Southern California Storm Water Monitoring Coalition (SMC) Southern California Regional Bioassessment Monitoring Program and the Bioassessment Working Group





#### Ventura County MS4 Permit – Bioassessment Requirements

#### **SMC Regional Monitoring Programs**

- Southern California Regional Bioassessment
  - (i) Probabilistic sites per watershed
    - (I) Ventura River 6
    - (II) Santa Clara River 3
    - (III) Calleguas Creek 6
  - (ii) Integrator sites per watershed
    - (I) Ventura River 1
    - (II) Santa Clara River 1
    - (III) Calleguas Creek 1
  - (iii) Fixed bioassessment sites
    - (I) Fixed urban site per major watershed 1
    - Site selection shall be determined by the results of the first year SMC results, as approved by the Executive Officer.

### Southern California Bight Projects

• Regional Monitoring Survey - 2008 and successive years



#### **Construction General Permits**

- Approved by CA State Board, 2009
- Bioassessment monitoring requirements for individual projects
- Heal the Bay advocacy (letters, testimony, conversations with staff)





# Conclusions

- Nonprofit/citizen-based monitoring makes a difference and can inform legislation!
- Bioassessment is now part of CWA legislation and permitting
  - 303(d) listings
  - Monitoring in NPDES permits
  - IBI standards?



Heal the Bay



# Heal the Bay Contacts

Alison Lipman (bioassessment) Stream Team Manager alipman@healthebay.org 310 451-1500 X130

Kirsten James (legislative questions) Water Quality Director kjames@healthebay.org 310 451-1500 x162

