

Table 1. Summary of Comments on Specific 303(d) Listings

3/16/2009

Water Segment	Pollutant	Current Proposed 303(d) Listing	PG&E Recommendations	Reason(s)
Bear River (Amador County, from Lower Bear River Reservoir to North Fork Mokelumne River)	Copper	List	List (based upon current data, not faulty historic data)	Factsheet uses a line of evidence that does not meet the SWRCB's Listing Policy Section 6.1.4. Only data collected during 2005 to the present should be used to make a listing determination.
North Fork Feather River (from below Lake Almanor to Lake Oroville)	Water Temperature	List	Do Not List	Biological data do not support listing of this river segment. Any potential listing/delisting should be analyzed based upon water segment delineation, and analysis of data available by river reach. Sullivan report should be used as a guideline or screening tool in concert with other lines of evidence in the assessment of the water segments. Ultimately, if other lines of evidence do not support listing the water segment should not be listed.
Seneca Reach of the NFFR (Canyon Dam to Caribou 1 and 2 Powerhouses)	Water Temperature	List	Do Not List	Water temperature (no exceedances of Sullivan guideline) and biological data do not support listing of this river segment.
Belden (i.e., Caribou) Reach of the NFFR (Belden Forebay to Belden Powerhouse)	Water Temperature	List	Do Not List	Biological data do not support listing of this river segment.
Rock Creek Reach of the NFFR (from Rock Creek Reservoir to Rock Creek Powerhouse)	Water Temperature	List	Do Not List	Biological data do not support listing of this river segment.
Cresta Reach of the NFFR (Cresta Reservoir to Cresta Powerhouse)	Water Temperature	List	Do Not List	Biological data do not support listing of this river segment.
Poe Reach of the NFFR (from Poe Reservoir to Poe Powerhouse)	Water Temperature	List	Do Not List	Biological data do not support listing of this river segment.
Big Bend Reach of NFFR (from Big Bend Reservoir to Lake Oroville)	Water Temperature	List	Do Not List	Biological data do not support listing of this river segment.

Table 1. Summary of Comments on Specific 303(d) Listings

3/16/2009

Water Segment	Pollutant	Current Proposed 303(d) Listing	PG&E Recommendations	Reason(s)
North Fork Feather River (from below Lake Almanor to Lake Oroville)	Mercury	List	Do Not List	Available data do not support listing of entire North Fork Feather River. Any potential listing/delisting should be analyzed based upon water segment delineation, and analysis of data available by river reach. The only reach that shows possible impairment is the Big Bend Reach.
Seneca Reach of the NFFR (Canyon Dam to Caribou 1 and 2 Powerhouses)	Mercury	List	Do Not List	Known data for fish tissue mercury analyses on the Seneca Reach of the NFFR, do not exceed any criteria and therefore do not show impairment, i.e., no justification for listing this water segment.
Belden (i.e., Caribou) Reach of the NFFR (Belden Forebay to Belden Powerhouse)	Mercury	List	Do Not List	No known data available to make a determination for this water segment.
Rock Creek Reach of the NFFR (from Rock Creek Reservoir to Rock Creek Powerhouse)	Mercury	List	Do Not List	No known data available to make a determination for this water segment.
Cresta Reach of the NFFR (Cresta Reservoir to Cresta Powerhouse)	Mercury	List	Do Not List	No known data available to make a determination for this water segment.
Poe Reach of the NFFR (from Poe Reservoir to Poe Powerhouse)	Mercury	List	Do Not List	Known data do not support listing, per the requirements in Table 3.1 of the Listing Policy. CVRWQCB's factsheet should be updated to reflect the erroneous data point that was inadvertently printed in the PG&E Application for License (see fact sheet).
Big Bend Reach of NFFR (from Big Bend Reservoir to Lake Oroville)	Mercury	List	List (Big Bend Reservoir only)	Data indicate potential impairment based upon fish tissue data analyzed for mercury in this water segment in Big Bend Reservoir only.

Table 1. Summary of Comments on Specific 303(d) Listings

3/16/2009

Water Segment	Pollutant	Current Proposed 303(d) Listing	PG&E Recommendations	Reason(s)
North Fork Feather River (from below Lake Almanor to Lake Oroville)	PCBs	List	Do Not List	Available data do not support listing of entire North Fork Feather River. Any potential listing/delisting should be analyzed based upon water segment delineation, and analysis of data available by river reach. The only reaches that show possible impairment are the Belden Reach, Poe Reservoir, and Big Bend Reservoir only.
Seneca Reach of the NFFR (Canyon Dam to Caribou 1 and 2 Powerhouses)	PCBs	List	Do Not List	No known available data to make a determination regarding listing. Therefore, no justification for listing this water segment.
Belden (i.e., Caribou) Reach of the NFFR (Belden Forebay to Belden Powerhouse)	PCBs	List	List	For the sample years 2001 and 2002, 20 of 44 samples exceeded the OEHHA PCB criterion (3.6 ppb) for protection of human health and this exceeds the allowable frequency in Table 3.1 of the SWRCB Listing Policy (SWRCB 2004). Therefore, there is justification for listing this water segment only.
Rock Creek Reach of the NFFR (from Rock Creek Reservoir to Rock Creek Powerhouse)	PCBs	List	Do Not List	No known available data to make a determination regarding listing. Therefore, no justification for listing this water segment.
Cresta Reach of the NFFR (Cresta Reservoir to Cresta Powerhouse)	PCBs	List	Do Not List	No known available data to make a determination regarding listing. Therefore, no justification for listing this water segment.
Poe Reach of the NFFR (from Poe Reservoir to Poe Powerhouse)	PCBs	List	List (Poe Reservoir only)	Data from the Poe Reservoir specifically were collected in 2002 and 2003 by PG&E. Six of 12 samples analyzed for PCBs in fish tissue exceeded the OEHHA 2008 Fish Contaminant Goal (3.6 ppb) to protect human health. This does exceed the allowable frequency listed in Table 3.1 of the SWRCB Listing Policy (SWRCB 2004). No known available PCB data from the river within Poe Reach; therefore, there is justification for listing the Poe Reservoir only for PCBs.
Big Bend Reach of NFFR (from Big Bend Reservoir to Lake Oroville)	PCBs	List	List (Big Bend Reservoir only)	Data were collected below Poe Powerhouse in Big Bend Reservoir in 2002 and 2003 for PCB analysis in fish tissue. Nine of the 18 fish sampled exceeded the OEHHA 2008 criterion for PCBs for the protection of human health. This exceeds the allowable frequency in Table 3.1 of the Listing Policy. No known fish tissue samples were collected in river below Big Bend Reservoir, therefore there is no justification for listing the river, but there is justification for listing Big Bend Reservoir only.

Table 1. Summary of Comments on Specific 303(d) Listings

3/16/2009

Water Segment	Pollutant	Current Proposed 303(d) Listing	PG&E Recommendations	Reason(s)
North Fork Feather River (from below Lake Almanor to Lake Oroville)	Unknown Toxicity	List	Do Not List	Available data do not support listing of entire North Fork Feather River. Any potential listing/delisting should be analyzed based upon water segment delineation, and analysis of data available by river reach. The only reach that shows possible impairment is the Big Bend Reach.
Seneca Reach of the NFFR (Canyon Dam to Caribou 1 and 2 Powerhouses)	Unknown Toxicity	List	Do Not List	There are no known available toxicity data for the NFFR reach between Lake Almanor (Canyon Dam) and the Caribou Powerhouses 1 and 2; consequently, there is no justification for listing this river segment for unknown toxicity.
Belden (i.e., Caribou) Reach of the NFFR (Belden Forebay to Belden Powerhouse)	Unknown Toxicity	List	Do Not List	There are no known available toxicity data for the NFFR reach between Belden Forebay and Belden Powerhouse; consequently, there is no justification for listing this river segment for unknown toxicity.
Rock Creek Reach of the NFFR (from Rock Creek Reservoir to Rock Creek Powerhouse)	Unknown Toxicity	List	Do Not List	There are no known available toxicity data from the Rock Creek river segment; consequently, there is no justification for listing this river segment for unknown toxicity.
Cresta Reach of the NFFR (Cresta Reservoir to Cresta Powerhouse)	Unknown Toxicity	List	Do Not List	There are no known available toxicity data from the Cresta river segment; consequently, there is no justification for listing this river segment for unknown toxicity.
Poe Reach of the NFFR (from Poe Reservoir to Poe Powerhouse)	Unknown Toxicity	List	Do Not List	There are no known available toxicity data from the Poe river segment upstream of Poe Powerhouse; consequently, there is no justification for listing this river segment for unknown toxicity.
Big Bend Reach of NFFR (from Big Bend Reservoir to Lake Oroville)	Unknown Toxicity	List	List	Based on the known available information, the only water segment that should be listed for unknown toxicity (due to an unknown source) is the Big Bend Reach from Big Bend Reservoir to Lake Oroville. Results indicated that 2 of 18 samples were toxic for survival and exceeded the narrative toxicity objective of the Basin Plan (2 of 9 from the NFFR downstream from Poe Powerhouse zero of 9 from the Poe Powerhouse discharge). In addition, 8 of 18 samples tested with Ceriodaphnia dubia exhibited reproductive toxicity and violated the narrative toxicity objective of the Basin Plan (5 of 10 samples from the NFFR downstream of Poe Powerhouse; and 3 of 8 samples from the Poe Powerhouse Discharge).

Table 1. Summary of Comments on Specific 303(d) Listings

3/16/2009

Water Segment	Pollutant	Current Proposed 303(d) Listing	PG&E Recommendations	Reason(s)
South Yuba River (from Lake Spaulding to Englebright Reservoir)	Water Temperature	List	Do Not List	Do Not List any river segments of the South Yuba River between Lake Spaulding and Englebright Reservoir. Address potential for listing the South Yuba River by water segments (federally recognized individual river reaches) and list or do not list based upon known available data or evidence for each individual river reach (water segment).
Reach #1: Jordan Reach (a total of 3.2 River Miles [RM]) from Jordan Creek Confluence (RM 40.2) to Rucker Creek Confluence (RM 37.0)	Water Temperature	List	Do Not List	Available receiving water temperature data indicate that the water segment does not exceed either the Sullivan et al. (2000) or the US EPA Region 10 (US EPA 2003) guidelines under normal operations and that the water segment is biologically healthy; therefore, this water body should not be listed for water temperature.
Reach #2: Rucker Reach (a total of 1.4 RM) from Rucker Creek Confluence (RM 37.0) to Fall Creek Confluence (RM 35.6)	Water Temperature	List	Do Not List	There are no known available water temperature data in Rucker Reach, however, water temperature data collected upstream (in Jordan Reach) and downstream (in Fall Reach) indicate that there is no justification for listing this reach on the 303(d) list of impaired water bodies.
Reach #3: Fall Reach (a total of 3.2 RM) from Fall Creek Confluence (RM 35.6) to Canyon Creek Confluence (RM 32.4)	Water Temperature	List	Do Not List	Known available water temperature data collected from Fall Reach do show that water temperatures reach 20°C or higher in the summer. However, hydrology information contained in PG&E's PAD (2008) indicates that the unimpaired hydrology in September is only 2.4 cfs higher than the regulated hydrology; and this would not result in significantly different water temperatures in this reach under natural conditions in the summer. Therefore, there is no justification for listing the Fall Reach on the 303(d) list for water temperature.
Reach #4: Canyon Reach (a total of 4.4 RM) from Canyon Creek Confluence (RM 32.4) to Poorman Creek Confluence (RM 28.0)	Water Temperature	List	Do Not List	Known available water temperature data collected from Canyon Reach show that water temperatures reach 20°C or higher in the summer. However, hydrology information contained in PG&E's PAD (2008) indicates that the unimpaired hydrology in August and September is virtually identical to the regulated hydrology in the South Yuba River at the Canyon Creek confluence; and this would not result in significantly different water temperatures in this reach under natural conditions in the summer. Therefore, there is no justification for listing the Canyon Reach on the 303(d) list for water temperature.
Reach #5: Poorman Reach (a total of 8.5 RM) from Poorman Creek Confluence (RM 28.0) to Humbug Creek Confluence (RM 19.5)	Water Temperature	List	Do Not List	Known available water temperature data collected from Poorman Reach show that water temperatures reach 20°C or higher in the summer (PG&E 2008). However, hydrology information contained in PG&E's PAD (2008) indicates that the unimpaired hydrology in the summer is virtually identical to the regulated hydrology in the summer; and this would not result in significantly different water temperatures in this reach under natural conditions in the summer. Therefore, there is no justification for listing the Poorman Reach on the 303(d) list for water temperature.
Reach #6: Humbug Reach (total of 19.5 RM), from Humbug Creek Confluence (RM 19.5) to Englebright Reservoir (RM 0.0)	Water Temperature	List	Do Not List	Known available water temperature data collected from Humbug Reach show that water temperatures reach 20°C or higher in the summer. However, hydrology information contained in PG&E's PAD (2008) indicates that the unimpaired hydrology in the summer is virtually identical to the regulated hydrology in the summer; and this would not result in significantly different water temperatures in this reach under natural conditions in the summer. Therefore, there is no justification for listing the Humbug Reach on the 303(d) list for water temperature.

Table 1. Summary of Comments on Specific 303(d) Listings

3/16/2009

Water Segment	Pollutant	Current Proposed 303(d) Listing	PG&E Recommendations	Reason(s)
South Yuba River (from Lake Spaulding to Englebright Reservoir)	Mercury	List	Do Not List	Do Not List any river segments of the South Yuba River between Lake Spaulding and Englebright Reservoir for mercury. Address potential for listing the South Yuba River by water segments (federally recognized individual river reaches) and list or do not list based upon known available data or evidence for each individual river reach (water segment).
Reach #1: Jordan Reach (a total of 3.2 River Miles [RM]) from Jordan Creek Confluence (RM 40.2) to Rucker Creek Confluence (RM 37.0)	Mercury	List	Do Not List	Samples collected from Jordan Reach below Lake Spaulding did not exceed the criteria, therefore no justification for listing.
Reach #2: Rucker Reach (a total of 1.4 RM) from Rucker Creek Confluence (RM 37.0) to Fall Creek Confluence (RM 35.6)	Mercury	List	Do Not List	No known fish tissue samples analyzed for mercury; therefore, no justification for listing this water segment.
Reach #3: Fall Reach (a total of 3.2 RM) from Fall Creek Confluence (RM 35.6) to Canyon Creek Confluence (RM 32.4)	Mercury	List	Do Not List	No known fish tissue samples analyzed for mercury; therefore, no justification for listing this water segment.
Reach #4: Canyon Reach (a total of 4.4 RM) from Canyon Creek Confluence (RM 32.4) to Poorman Creek Confluence (RM 28.0)	Mercury	List	Do Not List	One sample in Canyon Reach exceed the OEHHHA criterion for mercury; therefore, no justification of listing this water segment.
Reach #5: Poorman Reach (a total of 8.5 RM) from Poorman Creek Confluence (RM 28.0) to Humbug Creek Confluence (RM 19.5)	Mercury	List	Do Not List	No known fish tissue samples analyzed for mercury; therefore, no justification for listing this water segment.
Reach #6: Humbug Reach (total of 19.5 RM), from Humbug Creek Confluence (RM 19.5) to Englebright Reservoir (RM 0.0)	Mercury	List	Do Not List	One sample in Humbug Reach (most downstream segment) exceed the criterion, all other samples collected in Humbug Reach near Edwards Crossing (upstream from Bridgeport and downstream from Washington) did not exceed the criterion. Therefore, no justification for listing the water segment.
Willow Creek (Madera County)	Water Temperature	List	Do Not List	Use of a single water temperature criteria is insufficient; known readily available fish assemblage data from Willow Creek does not indicate impairment (2007 data). Fish assemblage data will continue to be collected throughout license. On-going six-year water temperature study will provide additional data. Current available water temperature data indicated that there is no justification of listing Willow Creek for water temperature because the known available biological data from 2007 do not indicate impairment due to water temperature. Therefore, there is no justification for listing this water segment based upon the known readily available data.